

Strengthening the effectiveness of development interventions in changing rural communities

Catherine Dom and Alula Pankhurst

Introduction

The chapters in this book have considered a range of different facets of change in the twenty WIDE communities. In the final part of the introductory chapter we summarised key findings from each of the chapters and identified three major cross-cutting themes. We now return to these findings and issues in this conclusion comprising three parts. We start by focussing on the issues relating to interventions raised in each of the chapters, highlighting the policy - and programme-related suggestions for improvements. We then turn to the three crosscutting themes or frameworks discussed in the introduction on: 1) growth, poverty and inequality, 2) space and time and 3) gender-age, women and youth, drawing out the relevant policy implications and suggestions. Finally, we consider the following four aspects of approaches to policy-making and implementation: 1) advocating adopting a holistic inter-sectoral approach, 2) adapting approaches flexibly to local context, 3) prioritising a grass-roots learning approach and working together within a broad coalition of actors.

Key policy relevant messages from the chapters

This section picks up on the review in the introduction of the major findings of each chapter, highlighting the role that interventions have played in development processes, and the potential suggestions for improvements to existing interventions and adoption of new approaches.

Rurbanisation, urban expansion, and thickening rural-urban links 2010-13

As noted in the introduction and analysed in detail in this chapter, Bevan describes three processes of urbanisation: 1) *rurbanisation*, the construction of 'urban' infrastructure and buildings within the *kebele* boundaries, 2) *thickening rural-urban linkages*, through development of linkages in trade, work, investment and access to modern human development and well-being services, and 3) *urban expansion* which increasingly is resulting in losses of rural land. These processes have had differential effects across the communities and for different categories of households and individuals. Remoteness and poverty were identified as key constraints hindering access to the positive effects of urbanisation.

The chapter concludes by suggesting some measures that could bring about greater benefits all round from processes of urbanisation.

First, Bevan advocates the wider implementation of programmes expanding rural roads such as the Universal Rural Road and Access Programme (URRAP). The last twenty years have seen massive progress in the expansion of the network of main roads (FDRE 2015b)¹. URRAP is a more recent initiative, and, while it has taken on an increasing profile in the course of the GTPI implementation, it focuses on connecting *kebele* centres to the main road network and not on internal *kebele* roads and paths. In her conclusion Bevan points out that, as most of the labour to build and maintain the latter is supposed to be voluntary, this is an issue both in communities where people have paid labour opportunities to which they give preference, and in communities with few opportunities where paid labour on rural roads would be an option for locally unemployed youth. Paying rather than relying on voluntary labour would, she argues, help accelerate the expansion of rural roads. Ensuring

¹ For instance, the average time to reach an allweather road decreased from 3.7 hours in 2009/10 to 1.8 in 2013/14; while approximately two thirds of all *kebele* centres are now connected through allweather roads.

minimal construction standards through greater complementary investment and professional oversight by the *weredas* would help the roads to last longer.

Second, Bevan suggests that institutionalising outreach services (health, education, agricultural advice) should go beyond the ‘single central village’ model, by using non-grid electricity to generate power for internet access and mobile phone-based apps that would reach remoter communities or areas outside of community centres, on the model of the fairly recent and apparently successful agricultural advice ‘hotline’ established by the Agricultural Transformation Agency (ATA 2015a). The potential of technology to expand service delivery outreach is highlighted in several other chapters and is discussed in the section on crosscutting themes in this concluding chapter.

Third, Bevan suggests that there is a need to invest more resources in safe drinking water and irrigation structures – themes that appear as well in several other chapters in this volume with regard to the importance of irrigation, and which she also discusses in relation to the importance of access to safe water in the chapter on mothers’ and babies’ wellbeing. Given its prominence in several of our analyses, irrigation is discussed as a crosscutting theme in the next section of this chapter.

Fourth, as also advocated in several other chapters, Bevan suggests the need to consider increasing support to individual or spontaneous group-based initiatives of young people, through packages of training, credit and land for those with promising projects. This would contribute to further expanding the non-farm sector, a critical objective in seeking to transform the structure of the Ethiopian economy, as discussed in the section on crosscutting themes.

Finally, Bevan also suggests that better coordinated and more transparent land use planning (notably avoiding situations in which there are two different plans by two different agencies for the same plot of land), improved management of compensation processes² and greater attention to consequences of planned changes (for instance in terms of protecting access to rural paths) would reduce the costs and potential negative consequences of urban expansion for rural communities. Given the pace of urbanisation in Ethiopia, such measures should go some way in defusing potential tensions arising from the inevitable expansion of urban areas putting pressure on rural land.

Differentiation, inequalities and social inclusion and exclusion in rural communities

The chapter on differentiation suggests that, alongside growth and transformation, differentiation has been accentuated both between and within communities as a result of development of infrastructure and communication, increased agricultural potential, notably through irrigation and integration with the market, leading to increased inequalities, the formation of elites, the very poor falling behind and some caught in poverty traps from which the destitute were not able to escape. These effects were more prominent in the communities with greater agricultural potential and those that were more integrated and closer to towns and cities, although these sites also offered more diversified opportunities for the poor.

The Government is well aware of the need to step up policies and interventions addressing the risk of non-inclusive economic growth, and has approved, in 2014, a Social Protection Policy to this effect. A number of suggestions are made in the chapter to build on this development.

First, Pankhurst argues, an approach is needed that recognises the diversity of households and people requiring social protection, builds linkages between formal social protection programmes and informal customary social protection institutions, seeks the collaboration of a wide range of actors (local governments, civil society organisations, NGOs, community leaders and local customary institutions, as well as the private sector), and recognises the importance of empathy and respect

² This is also noted in Pankhurst and Piguet 2009 in their book ‘*Moving People in Ethiopia: Development, Displacement and the State*’.

towards poor and vulnerable people by government agents at all levels, and especially those working at the community levels notably the DAs, HEWs and *kebele* managers and administration.

Second, the deployment of a cadre of specially trained community social workers is a welcome intention, which will require considerable resources for their training and deployment, and tailoring social protection programmes to the needs of vulnerable groups requires the involvement of local stakeholders – as piloted in a Social Cash Transfer Pilot Programme (SCTPP) with the establishment of hybrid government/non-government Community Care Coalitions (CCCs)³.

Third, the livelihoods of poor households with some labour capacity but facing various constraints in engaging in farming could be improved. Like Loveday in the chapter on women’s economic participation, Pankhurst suggests the need for further promoting non-agricultural activities, extension, credit services and in some cases, grants or asset transfers tailored to individual needs. Stepping up such support through expanded youth job-creation programmes is also important to address the widespread rural youth unemployment documented in this chapter and those on youth transitions and education.

Fourth, despite considerable progress in gender relations and women’s rights, Pankhurst suggests, along with Loveday in her chapter, that there remains considerable scope for further progress in promoting and achieving women’s rights and gender equality. This is further discussed in the policy considerations from the chapter on youth and as a crosscutting issue in the next section.

Finally, Pankhurst suggests the need to further promote insurance schemes and subsidies for the poor to access them, as a way of preventing the onset of downwards spirals, which shocks, having more profound consequences for the poor, often generate. As argued by Tefera and Dom in the relevant chapter, successful individuals would also benefit from access to insurance mechanisms so as to mitigate the effects of setbacks that otherwise can write-off years of entrepreneurial efforts. The Government has indicated that it is committed to rapidly expand the Community-Based Health Insurance scheme (Ministry of Health 2015)⁴. However, thus far, insurance mechanisms against production/economic shocks have been slower in attracting policymakers’ attention, although there are signs that this may be about to change⁵.

Youth transitions to adulthood and the role of interventions

We have argued that the shape of young people transitions to adulthood directly influences the roles they will be able to play in their own and Ethiopia’s development. In a country where more than half the population is under the age of 20, these transitions matter enormously. Cognisant of that, in the GTPII the government has committed to the full implementation of the post-2015 youth empowerment global goals, with a focus on education, lifelong learning and decent employment for

³ In the final evaluation of the SCTPP, Guush Berhane et al. (2015) highlighted that, while CCCs functioned generally well as targeting and oversight mechanisms, their role in mobilising local social protection resources had been more limited. To some extent they had been effective in making social protection of the most vulnerable the business of everyone, although their voluntary nature was also a challenge.

⁴ The Health Sector Transformation Plan foresees that in the high financing scenario, by 2020 the CBHI will cover 80% of the population in 80% of the weredas and subsidise at least 10% of the households enrolled.

⁵ E.g. based on findings from the Index-Based Livestock Insurance (IBLI) scoping research project in Ethiopia and a number of other countries (Greatrex 2016), Ethiopia reportedly intends to introduce index-based livestock and crop insurance, with the goal of reaching 200,000 households in an initial phase and millions over time (see <https://ibli.ilri.org/2016/01/20/ethiopia-weather-insurance/> accessed 25 September 2016). National insurance companies have expressed interest (see e.g. <http://newbusinessethiopia.com/index.php/society/16-environment/715/715>, November 2015, accessed 25 September 2016). As another example of this growing interest, <https://asokoinsight.com/news/ethiopia-set-to-introduce-agriculture-insurance-to-15-million-smallholder-farmers> reports that “*The Public Financial Enterprises Agency of Ethiopia (PFEA), Ethiopian Insurance Corporation (EIC), Agricultural Transformation Agency (ATA), Kifiya Financial Technology (KFT), National Metrology Agency (NMA) and ITC University of Twente (Netherlands)... launched a new crop insurance that covers 15 million smallholder farmers in five years*” (March 2016, accessed 25 September 2016).

young people, whereas young women's needs are also addressed in the 'gender equity' goals. In policy terms youth affairs have been separated from the Ministry of Women and Children and have recently been placed under a separate ministry along with sports, which hopefully can provide the impetus for designing more robust youth strategies.

In this chapter Pankhurst looks at four transition domains (personal, family, work and community). He argues that a foundation for more responsive interventions would be to recognise the cultural, social and economic rationales of customary concepts and practices around youth transitions as well as their cultural diversity, and makes a number of suggestions along these lines with a view to improving interventions addressing different transitions.

First, Pankhurst, along with Bevan in her chapter on young women's health and wellbeing, advocates adopting a more comprehensive response to young people's reproductive health needs, which would include addressing the constraints that unmarried young people still face in accessing contraceptives, sometimes arising from the very health professionals from whom they should get support. Consideration should be given to ensure access to safe abortion to minors unable to support a child, taking advantage of the relevant but largely unknown provision in the revised Criminal Code of 2004⁶. There is also a need to recognise and address the reproductive role of young men and their responsibilities in stopping practices harmful to young women, as also noted by Bevan.

Second, in relation to early marriage, Pankhurst suggests that government action needs to recognise the differences between pre-teen, early teen and late teen but 'legally underage' marriage, and concentrate on the early teens. A focus of resources on the more damaging early teen marriage would be more cost effective, and might make the ban more widely accepted. At the same time, he argues, bearing in mind that late teens just above the legal age may face similar problems as those just underage (such as perceived lack of other options, parental pressure etc.), what matters more than age *per se* is the question of girls' agency in choosing whether to marry, when and whom. Hence, interventions should focus on consent and expanding birth registration to eventually resolve ambiguities about girls' ages. Furthermore, consideration should be given to special dispensations, with the necessary judicial oversight, for older teens wanting to get married. This, which is done in many Western countries, is allowed by the Ethiopian Revised Family Code⁷; however, the relevant provision is not well known. It should be discussed and widely publicised as this could allay community and parental concerns.

Third, Pankhurst suggests that supporting young people's work transitions in rural Ethiopia requires a multi-faceted approach. Rural job creation is increasingly prominent in the government policy agenda – as shown for instance by the high-level workshop organised by the Ministry of Agriculture in February 2016 to consult on a new strategy.

⁶ The revised Criminal Code (2004) allows for abortion in the case of rape and incest and women who are either due to physical or mental problems or their minority are unfit to bring up the child (article 551d). According to article 552, the Ministry of Health was to issue a directive whereby pregnancy may be terminated under article 551 in a manner that does not affect the interest of pregnant women (FDRE 2004). This directive, if it exists, is not well known and not easily found.

⁷ The Code stipulates that the Ministry of Justice "on the application of the future spouses or the parents or guardians of one of them for serious cause grant dispensation of not more than two years" (FDRE 2000: article 7.2).

Introduction – High Level Consultation Workshop on the Development of a Rural Job Creation Strategy – Ministry of Agriculture, February 2016

To succeed in achieving transformative job opportunity creation and mainstreaming it into the entire development undertaking, GTP II has established a new structure since September 2015, called the Rural Job Opportunity Creation and Food Security Sector as one of the sectors within the MOA. Similar structures exist in urban areas under the Ministry of Urban Development. The establishment of a dedicated sector reflects increasing recognition that creating access to employment and job opportunity for the growing number of youth and unemployed population is key to ensuring stability and securing economic and social prosperity for the country.

The following approaches could be considered in such a strategy; Pankhurst suggests there is a need to: build on the considerable entrepreneurial spirit that many youth deploy and expand the support to MSEs to small towns and rural *kebele* centres; learn from the few cases of successful youth cooperatives; prioritise young women's involvement in women and youth cooperatives; and generally pay greater attention to young women's productive roles – an issue further discussed by Loveday in this volume. Furthermore, greater attention to training and skills development would help increase young women's involvement in business and enterprise, he suggests – in tune with Dom advocating the need to raise the profile of technical and vocational education as one of the ways to address both young men's and women's underemployment.

Finally, seeing how the hindrances on and delays in economic and social transitions to work and marriage also prevented young men, and especially young women, from taking a greater role in community affairs, Pankhurst suggests that greater support to youth's work transitions and support for youth associations to take a more economic role hence actively engaging with young people's most pressing difficulties, could contribute to more successful transitions toward economic independence which would in turn gradually also improve this community transition.

Education in rural Ethiopia (2010-13): aspirations and uncertainties

Progress with education in Ethiopia has been widely praised, making it twice in a well-known 'development success stories' series (Engel, J. 2011; Lenhardt et al. 2015). This chapter suggests that the praise was relevant. Yet, Dom also shows that, as should be expected, new challenges have emerged while there remains work to do to address older ones. There has been considerable progress in access, particularly to primary school, but quality issues remain serious concerns, with evidence of declining standards (Tassew Woldehanna and Aregawi Gebremedhin 2016). There remains scope for making education yet more inclusive, Dom suggests, while at the same time re-balancing the education system away from an overly academic focus, with a view to better enabling the many young people from rural Ethiopia to grow up into able and economically independent adults (see Pankhurst above).

First, Dom argues, there is need for innovative thinking to make education more inclusive. Alongside the directions outlined in the fifth Education Sector Development Programme (MOE 2016), a first set of measures could target additional resources to disadvantaged schools, such as school feeding and other incentive programmes where/when relevant, school grants calibrated on remoteness/poverty, and additional support/incentives for teachers in hardship posts. Formalising a system of subsidies and exemptions from school contributions and providing scholarships to cover indirect schooling costs would go some way to help poorer households. Access to water was inadequate or non-existent in more than half the schools, with adverse consequences on girls' attendance – highlighting the need for more attention to water supply, as also suggested by Bevan in her chapters on urbanisation and on mothers and babies.

Second, a range of more flexible approaches could be promoted. Some of the causes of irregular attendance could be addressed through maintaining Alternative Basic Education in some areas, and further encouraging schools to adapt the calendar to make it more flexible to local needs. It would

also make sense, Dom suggests, to make it easier for children and young people to alternate school and work, acknowledging that this will be a necessity for many and need not be a bad thing. Expanding evening class options at all levels, public provision or scholarships for distance education, and greater modularisation of courses at secondary and university levels (on the model of the TVET system) would all facilitate greater inclusiveness of the education system.

Third, regarding girls' education there is widespread recognition among policymakers and practitioners that further relentless efforts are needed to ensure gender equity, as again noted for instance in the fifth ESDP (MOE 2016). That, Dom suggests together with Pankhurst and Bevan, requires greater recognition of the multiple dimensions of girls' transitions to womanhood. Girls and their parents will not stop seeing early marriage as a sensible strategy simply through campaigns to prevent this forcibly, but attitudes are likely to change if they see that there are other feasible options, including locally relevant skill development opportunities for those less academically gifted or who cannot afford to migrate. In a similar vein, girls would be better protected from unwanted pregnancies if they knew more about, and had easier access to, contraception. At the same time, Dom argues, early marriage and unwanted pregnancies will still occur. Rather than denial or stigma, schools and communities could support young married women and young mothers, married or not, in re-admitting them, and establishing day-care centres for their babies/young children. Such measures, as well as further promoting local female role models of all kinds, as also advocated by Loveday, would complement attention to issues such as water at school, support to menstruating girls with sanitary materials, and separate latrines.

Finally, regarding the question of 'education for what', Dom documents increasing aspirations and expectations geared towards academic education, leading to rising disillusion and in some settings hopelessness. Yet both the GTP II economic transformation agenda and the ongoing transformation of rural societies and economies will increasingly call for skilled technicians of all sorts. Addressing this mismatch between aspirations and opportunities means reorienting the education system so that it "*imparts the skills needed to work*" (Cleland et al., forthcoming). In turn, Dom argues, this calls for significantly expanding the non-formal/informal TVET offered for pre-grade 10 dropouts or grade 10 leavers with scores insufficient to join post-grade 10 options, with government in the lead as the private sector may take time to respond to the needs. Action is needed on the demand side too, with campaigns promoting the kind of economically successful people that had begun to be found in some of the WIDE communities such as rich grainmill technicians etc. – as documented by Tefera and Dom earlier in this volume.

Reproductive health and wellbeing: girls in transition to adulthood 2010-13

In this chapter Bevan discusses a series of risks facing girls in their transitions to becoming women. Her suggestions on how to further reduce these risks and enhance their wellbeing, address issues about which the government until recently had little visibility, as is the case more generally in relation to violence against women (UNICEF 2012)⁸. However, the government has recently committed to step up action – as articulated in the National Alliance to End Child Marriage (launched in October 2013) and the National Strategy on Harmful Traditional Practices (MWYCA 2014). In her chapter Bevan presents specific suggestions relating to the different risks.

First, regarding female circumcision, Bevan notes that in a number of communities where the ban was enforced, it sometime drove the practice underground, though in others there were signs of attitude change especially among girls and young women. In other places, while local enforcement

⁸ UNICEF 2012 notes that "*comprehensive data is not available on the magnitude of violence against women and girls*" but "*smaller studies, media reports and reports of cases in law enforcement institutions indicate that violence is pervasive*". The report mentions a 2005 WHO multi-country study focusing on rural weredas in SNNPR which found that 71% women had suffered physical or sexual violence by a male partner. The DHS 2005 reports that 81% of women in Ethiopia justified wife beating when asked, and there was even a slight deterioration compared to 1997 and 2000. The subsequent DHS no longer covered this topic.

of the ban was half-hearted, support for the practice was strong, drawing on the two cultural logics also noted by Pankhurst related to girls' marriageability and protection (Boyden et al. 2011). Bevan agrees with Pankhurst that strategies to reduce the practice should combine law enforcement with strong persuasion campaigns, enlisting the support of local opinion-makers such as churches and clan leaders, alongside government and NGO actors.

Second, regarding the still prevalent and often hidden risk of rape, Bevan suggests that a strong campaign to involve men and boys in intervening to stop rapes and bringing perpetrators to justice would make a difference, as well as clear instructions for *kebele* officials and militia, especially in remoter communities where it is more difficult and may take more time for *wereda* officials to investigate. She suggests that rape victims should be provided support (e.g. access to treatment for STDs and trauma), of which there is little evidence in the WIDE data.

Third, Bevan suggests that the young women who are victims of abduction should get special support from women affairs' offices and schools to reject unwanted marriages subsequent to the rape accompanying abduction, and should be encouraged to pursue alternatives such as education (a point also made by Dom in the chapter on education) or income-generating activities.

Fourth, with regard to early marriage, Bevan, like Pankhurst, suggests that it is important to distinguish between pre-teen, mid-teen and late teen early marriages, since the health risks, likelihood of forced marriage and detrimental consequences on their lives are much greater for the younger age group. In contrast, some older teenage girls marry voluntarily, sometimes in opposition to parental wishes, especially where girls do not have other opportunities of continuing education, training, or finding work, or when they become pregnant. Special dispensations for 16/17 year old girls should therefore be considered, with proper judicial oversight to ensure that the marriages are voluntary, and, as noted earlier, the fact that the revised family code article 7.2 allows this should be made more widely known. This would increase community acceptance of the ban and allow focusing scarce resources on more effective prevention of the much more problematic pre-teen and early-teen marriages.

Fifth, the constraints on unmarried girls gaining access to contraception, and the problems with pregnancies, risks of unsafe abortions, denial of paternity, ostracism and difficulties of single parenthood need to be addressed. Bevan suggests that one way to reduce parental fears of pregnancy before marriage would be to convince community opinion leaders that allowing unmarried girls' access to contraception is by far preferable, and would also reduce the risk of unsafe abortions. Health Extension Workers should also focus on effective contraception advice to young newly-married girls so that they can postpone their first pregnancy – in this way reducing the pregnancy risks associated with early marriage.

Finally, and more generally, Bevan argues, the focus of interventions needs to be on improving education campaigns and implementing laws, rather than changing them. Collecting local data would allow government officials to understand the complex links between the forms and salience of harmful practices and influencing factors such as remoteness as well as cultural and regional aspects, and tailor responses accordingly. Law enforcement and campaigns should go hand-in-hand, with the support from influential local actors, notably strong women in women affairs' offices, clan leaders etc.. Focusing on changing male attitudes, enlisting support from the 'progressive' ones to bring offenders to justice, would also make a difference (Jones *et al.* 2014 talk about promoting "new masculinities" that would be "caring, non-violent and equitable"). In the same vein, Bevan notes, the government has a robust National Adolescent and Youth Reproductive Health Strategy; what is needed is implementing it, with much more attention than seems to be reflected in the Health Sector Transformation Plan.

Reproductive health and wellbeing: mothers and infants 2010-13

In this chapter Bevan focuses on changes in the wellbeing of the mother-baby couple and how

government action interacted with this through interventions with indirect consequences for mothers and babies, and directly in relation to availability and use of health care services. She notes that developments were not reaching women equally, as also reflected in recent statistics showing that for instance, only 23 per cent of the poorest women attend ANC versus 75 per cent of the wealthiest ones (Central Statistical Authority 2014). In the Health Sector Transformation Plan the government commits to address this, by paying special attention to universal health coverage and monitoring a set of equity-specific indicators with a focus on maternal and child health (Federal Ministry of Health 2015).

The major risks to mothers and babies that Bevan identified related to diet and included drought, seasonality, poverty and remoteness. Programmes improving internal and external roads and reducing remoteness would thus go a long way to help achieve the government maternal and child health goals. Bevan also makes a series of more specific suggestions.

First, she suggests that there is scope to do more about diets: in particular, increased and diversified production of crops and livestock products have great potential benefits for the mother-baby couple which could be further enhanced. The inclusion of the concept of 'nutrition sensitive agriculture' in the government Agricultural Transformation Agenda (ATA 2015b) indicates that this potential has begun to be understood. However, a recent study on 'leveraging agriculture for nutrition' calls for more focus and more effective mainstreaming of this objective in policy development, research and extension services (Beyero et al. 2015).

Second, access to safe water had improved, but was still beset with problems in 2013. Only five communities had virtually universal access, though some people could not afford the costs; and poor maintenance and slow repairs of water points was a widespread issue. The latter finding reflects a wider trend which, a recent study notes, suggests that insufficient resources are devoted to operations and maintenance (World Bank 2016a). Greater attention to maintaining existing schemes would go some way in addressing constraints on access to safe water, alongside further investment in new schemes.

Third, there was no general awareness of the maternity risks associated with heavy work; and in only one of the PSNP communities was the official rule exempting pregnant and lactating women from public works mentioned. This disregard of official policy, also noted by Loveday, is an example where better awareness and more effective implementation of guidelines could make a difference. The PSNP and emergency food aid, where present, helped address the effects of drought, and there was evidence of the poverty-reducing effect of the PSNP. However, it played different roles in different communities as the coverage varied much (from nearly all households benefitting in one community to only 9 per cent in another) and its effects depended on other community-specific dynamics (see Bevan et al. 2013).

Fourth, regarding the poorest, free healthcare for poor people was no longer available in most communities; and, as further discussed by Pankhurst, support for poor and vulnerable groups was limited. With poverty a major cause of mother-baby illbeing and rural inequality increasing, there is scope, Bevan suggests, for government to revisit local tax and contribution systems which in the WIDE communities tended to be quite regressive. This resonates with the 2014 Poverty Assessment which stresses, that while striving to enhance domestic revenue mobilisation as stipulated in the GTPII, the government should pay greater attention to equity and progressivity issues (World Bank 2015). This, in rural communities, must account for the real tax burden of households, including contributions of all sorts (in the form of cash, materials and voluntary labour for school, road, water etc.).

Fifth, regarding maternal and child health care, Bevan shows that provision had expanded, though there remained several types of constraints. In addition to remoteness, discussed earlier, there were also human resource issues: too few or insufficiently trained health extension workers, lacking transport, unwilling to live in remote areas, not being replaced when on study or maternity leave,

and involved in too many other activities. The community 'support structure' had evolved from health volunteers in 2010 to health/women development army in 2013, but the latter was generally not functioning as it should. Reviewing the role of health extension and the 'go-between' health extension workers, their work conditions and the demands and expectations placed on them would be important.

The provision of ANC, not very clearly defined, was hampered by lack of instruments, distance to health centres and rude service, so that demand was low, especially from poor women. Government policy about deliveries had shifted, with in 2010 attempts to provide equipment at health posts and train HEWs on clean and safe delivery, whereas in 2013 the focus was on all deliveries to take place at health centres with skilled staff. This had begun to be implemented in 2013 but even in these better connected communities there were supply and demand issues, including poor service quality, insufficient or male-only staff, transport and drug costs, and rare availability of ambulances. Moreover, being out in public very shortly after delivery was culturally unacceptable - Villanucci and Fantini (2016) talk about incompatible logics, with birth and delivery being essentially intimate, domestic matters for people, 'reduced' to technical medical acts in the policymaking sphere. There was widespread awareness of 'good' post-natal practices, but some mothers, too busy, too poor or simply reluctant, did not practise them. On all these aspects, there was some evidence that HEWs, under pressure to achieve targets, tended to report what ought to happen rather than what was happening.

Deriving from this analysis, Bevan suggests, different mixes of mother-baby services need to be designed and implemented in order to take account of communities' access, settlement and urban proximity patterns. Based on the WIDE evidence, moving to a fully modernised delivery system across the country will be a slow process. In the meantime, mothers and babies would be safer if they could call on a range of options, coordinated by 'upgraded' HEWs (as planned in the HTSP) and involving subsidising costs for poor women advised to deliver at health centres or having to go to a hospital; re-instating improved 'clean and safe' delivery by HEWs at health posts; and training TBAs to help women delivering at home, and members of the women/health development army so they could act as a final 'backup'. This could be made more efficient by providing access to transport for HEWs; and expanding on-and off-grid electrification to allow local actors to call advisory services at nearby health centres or hospitals or from a 'delivery advice hotline' that could be set-up on the model of the agricultural extension service hotline (ATA 2015a).

Bevan's second major suggestion is to mainstream maternity in development discourse and practices. Women have multiple roles, and too often the 'baby-making' role is marginalised. Correcting this would go a long way to improve mothers' and babies' wellbeing, she suggests, giving examples such as inclusion of special nutrition programmes for pregnant and lactating mothers and emergency baby milk in all drought emergency responses; ensuring that work exemption rules, like in the PSNP, are implemented and expanded to all labour programmes etc.

Economic participation of women and girls in rural Ethiopia (2010-13)

Enhancing women's participation in economic activities has been a longstanding policy concern of the Ethiopian government. This chapter speaks to this agenda, by showing how economic opportunities for women and girls had expanded in rural communities over fifteen years. However, increased economic participation of women and girls owed relatively little to livelihood interventions. Mainstream ones, in principle also addressed to women, often 'missed' them; and women-focused livelihood interventions were few, found in only half of the communities. Women, especially when married, were often overlooked by agricultural extension services, in spite of the policy to the contrary. Or DAs' advice often focused on customary female farming activities such as gardening or poultry rearing, which were practical for married women with family responsibilities, but less valued especially by the younger unmarried women, and those who were more educated and sought activities that would bring them an income and some form of independence.

Women had equal opportunity to engage in PSNP labour but this could be harmful as gender-sensitive measures foreseen in policy (adjusted work norms for women, direct support for pregnant ones) were rarely implemented, with negative effects on women's and babies' wellbeing, as highlighted by Bevan in the related chapter. Young women were often not involved in youth cooperatives, (due to a range of factors including lack of information, focus on activities traditionally considered 'male', and unattainable saving requirements as also noted in the chapter on youth transitions). There was little support to non-farm activities, which were crucial to many women's livelihoods, resulting in an underdeveloped rural non-farm enterprise sector (see Habtamu Fuje and Lire Ersado 2016) and frustrating young people. Most of the women cooperatives were struggling due to problems with output marketing or input supply, insufficient management skills, lack of support including in some cases from local authorities. Access to credit had expanded and credit had been useful in some cases. But generally it was either said to be limited or hard to access, or in some instances women reportedly were coerced into taking loans, which especially the poorer ones found risky and which in some cases had led to further impoverishment when women's activities failed.

Several approaches, Loveday suggests, could be considered to expand the reach of interventions in support of women's economic activities.

First, measures to support rural development more broadly, such as expanding micro/small enterprise development programmes to rural centres, could be important, as suggested in several other chapters in this volume. Alternative mechanisms could be considered to support the poorest to access capital through grants/asset transfers as a step toward credit-worthiness, as also suggested by Pankhurst in relation to poor people more generally.

Second, stronger implementation could be promoted of existing policies targeting women, for instance, in finding ways to encourage DAs to work with women (see ATA 2015a), as well as paying attention to young women's specific interests and constraints, in supporting the establishment of youth and women cooperatives, and ensuring that young women are included and able to participate on an equal basis.

Third, Loveday suggests, there is scope for revisiting gender equity messages in light of the changing activities and roles of women and of the legitimate concerns of men with these evolutions, leading to resistance in some instances. Recognising and debating men's concerns may better address them, while encouraging local role models to share their experience, informally, at schools etc., could both help other women, and begin to convince men of the benefits of considering women as equal partners.

Finally, Loveday suggests, ensuring that the ongoing expansion of economic opportunities for women and girls is equitable and inclusive calls for implementation of existing policy provisions, for instance towards equal pay for equal tasks, provision of child care options and maternity rights. These could be explicitly included in minimum work condition regulations, and both women and investors be made more aware of employment rights.

Migrating for work from rural communities (2010-13)

In reviewing the WIDE evidence, Dom found a marked increase in migration notably abroad and especially to the Gulf, with greater numbers of women deciding to migrate having seen that successful migrants were able to improve their livelihoods, despite an awareness of the potential risks. On the whole, Dom explains, the greater mobility found in the WIDE communities was a product of their development, and this is an instance of a broader international pattern suggesting that development does not reduce migration (Clemens 2014). As rural communities continue to modernise, outmigration is poised to further increase. On the basis of the WIDE evidence, Dom suggests that well-managed, rural outmigration could significantly contribute to the development of the migrants' home communities as well as to the government's goal of economic transformation, which requires labour to move into non-agricultural sectors.

Undoubtedly, migration is a sensitive issue; as such it would be useful, Dom suggests, to strengthen the capacity of managing it through a clear policy guiding all those involved and research that would help policymakers to understand its complex, diverse and evolving patterns across the country. Such a policy should aim to maximise the advantages that can be derived from migration while minimising the risks.⁹ At a practical level, a number of measures could help maximise the returns of successful migration at the same time as contributing to other development objectives.

First, cheaper and more efficient banking and transfer procedures that would encourage migrants and their families to use formal financial institutions would help to increase financial inclusion in rural areas as planned in the GTPII¹⁰. Remittances and savings could also be used in part to subscribe to health and other forms of insurance, thus also formalising their social protection role. Allowing the use of remittances as collateral for loans would multiply their economic investment potential. Local authorities could develop advisory services to help migrants' families and returnees to select worthwhile investments, which could include the co-financing of local infrastructure development that would further boost local economic activity, as long as sufficient trust can be established.

Second, it would be important to think of ways of making migration experiences more profitable. A combination of better information on, and preparation for, the jobs available, better management systems, and strengthening and enforcing of the relevant legal frameworks would go a long way to enhance the developmental potential of migration, both urban/industrial and abroad.

Third, with regard to migration for work in towns and industrial jobs, recent Ethiopia-specific evidence that migrants tend to be more entrepreneurial than their urban-born counterparts (Cleland et al., forthcoming) and that encouraging self-employment can lead to better wages for the poor than industrial jobs (Blatman and Dercon 2016) suggests that there is a case for ensuring that urban migrants have access to Micro/Small Enterprise support programmes. Greater attention also could be devoted to effective prevention of exploitative or hazardous labour conditions, including in the domestic and hospitality service sectors in which many women are working, and in smaller towns and factories that may be attractive to many as they offer jobs closer to home.

Fourth, the government has gone to considerable length to strengthen the legal framework for international migration, with the recent anti-trafficking and revised employment abroad proclamations (FDRE 2015a, FDRE 2016). Making the legal channel practically more accessible, cheaper and more time-efficient would help overcome the widespread perception that, however risky, irregular migration is quicker and cheaper. Such incentives for adopting the legal channel and avoiding the more dangerous illegal approach would increase safety and maximise benefits not just from the migrants but for the country's economy as a whole.

Finally, consideration could also be given to developing formal financing options to prevent poorer households from using harmful strategies to send someone abroad; seeking ways of expanding legal work opportunities in-country and abroad for young men; and carefully considering cases of just underage would-be migrants who, if not provided encouragement to work locally or given the option to migrate legally, are most likely to continue to do so through irregular channels.

Insights on economic success in rural communities in 2010/13

In this chapter Dom and Tefera found evidence that economic success resulted from similar combinations of interacting factors: government action and broad contextual changes brought new opportunities in principle accessible to all in the community; whilst personal initiative, as well as

⁹ For further suggestions on such a migration policy see Pankhurst and Piguet 2009.

¹⁰ In 2010 the Commercial Bank of Ethiopia had stopped charging commissions on Western Union transfers sent through its branches. There were more than 40 money transfer operators and 17 commercial banks in Ethiopia, thus potential to expand such measures (<http://ethiopianbusinessreview.net/index.php/economy-finance/item/450-fixing-the-leaks-ethiopia-benefits-from-remittance-boom-through-formal-channels> accessed 10 October 2016).

access to some form of initial capital, were more matters of individual mind-set and circumstances. One key point emerging from this evidence, the authors argue, is that economic success cannot just be replicated through the same 'standard' actions for all; it requires actions that are rooted in the specificities of the local context, and tailored to individual circumstances and learning trajectories. The authors propose a number of more specific suggestions.

First, given the evidence presented that individual initiative was important, encouraging individual entrepreneurship should therefore also matter, the authors argue, alongside the many forms of government support to group-based initiatives. This would require both closer attention from local level government agents and their superiors to local expertise and innovation, and greater recognition of the increasing internal diversity of the local rural economies.

Second, government action in rural communities is still mainly focused on the farm sector; yet, as Bevan suggests in her urbanisation chapter, and as the authors of this chapter show through the diversity of successful profiles they found, communities are no longer rural in the same way as in the mid-1990s. Complementary forms of action are needed, such as support to investments in small/medium-scale agro-processing ventures (localising the concept of value chain at *kebele* or *wereda* level based on existing successful activities). Moreover, as Dom also suggests in relation to migration-related investments, local provision of business-oriented advice could broaden the perspectives of local entrepreneurs and assist them in their undertakings (notably linking them up with training and credit opportunities and supporting them in land acquisition).

Third, the government commitment to pursue the 'big push' in rural infrastructure development that has been seen, especially over the past fifteen years, bodes well. However, given the scale of the needs, there could be a case, the authors suggest, to target this investment on local economic niches, for instance focusing on areas with irrigation potential, and connecting roads between small urbanising centres.

Fourth, a number of government actions relating to agriculture stood out as important in many of the cases of economic success. Agricultural extension services were an example of interventions broadly perceived positively. Despite some issues with inadequately skilled DAs and lack of timeliness, unsuitability, and, above all, high costs of inputs, these services were found to be useful by all successful farmers. Many of them explained how the combination of increased production thanks to better farming practices, higher prices for their produces, and easier access to growing urban markets, had been key to their success.

In contrast, government action was less effective in a number of important farm activities. Irrigation, which was crucial in explaining some big farmers' success (and as highlighted by Pankhurst and Loveday, providing daily labour opportunities as a knock-on effect), and which we discuss further in the cross-cutting issues, depended almost exclusively on local initiative and private investment. Farmers growing high-value 'alternative' crops had either no support at all (for instance for *chat* and eucalyptus), or no specialised advice (e.g. for spices). Venturing into livestock rearing for fattening or dairy production could be highly beneficial, especially if market linkages are developed. However, livestock extension services were less developed than for crops; and farmers were often left on their own in cases of weather- or epidemic-related or other losses.

The government Agricultural Transformation Agenda (ATA 2015b) recognises the importance of irrigation, high value crops and livestock. What is needed in implementing this, the authors suggest, is making extension services more context-specific and demand-led, using innovative means, such as ICT-based access to remote specialised advice on new crops etc. There also is scope for greater government investment in irrigation when it is beyond private reach, and greater attention to maintenance of existing schemes. In relation to livestock, alongside further strengthening of extension and veterinary services, there is considerable potential in insurance schemes that would mitigate the effects of production shocks, as also noted by Pankhurst, and as is increasingly recognised in policy circles.

Fifth, across the range of economically successful profiles, access to financial capital was often critical. However, formal credit was generally considered as problematic especially due to unattainable collateral requirements, red-tape, or loans being too small. Many individuals called instead on informal means – there were for instance *iqqub* worth several hundred thousand *birr*. Lending strategies and modalities that would recognise the needs of the much changed rural economies and would offer local entrepreneurs reasonably-sized loans, would give a boost to the government objective of raising financial inclusion in rural areas. However, it would in turn require innovative ideas on new types of collaterals adapted to rural contexts, such as title deeds for high quality rural assets and houses.

Sixth, the authors found that taxation and trade/business regulation practices were perceived as obstacles; those affected were calling for greater transparency and consistency in applying licensing and taxation standards. Migration had been an important source of financial capital for some of the successful individuals, but, as Dom suggests elsewhere in this volume, whilst rural outmigration has great potential as a factor of rural development, exploiting it better would require a change in mind-set and migration management practices.

Seventh, this chapter also shows that economic success was vulnerable to a variety of fluctuations and shocks (e.g. fluctuating product price, production shock); and that diversification within and across farm and non-farm sectors was key both to mitigate these risks, and to enable entrepreneurs to further grow by cross-investing the profits of successful activities into new ones or others needing a boost. This, the authors argue, calls for caution when promoting household or community specialisation, and new government strategies such as the Agricultural Commercialisation Clusters (ATA 2015b) should recognise the risks of mono-cropping and undiversified trade activity, and allow local economic actors to pursue proven strategies to mitigate them.

Finally, this and a number of other chapters in this volume illustrate that, while the farm sector could provide a foundation to economic success at both individual and community levels, diversification into the non-farm sector was indispensable to sustain and expand it. In other words, our research suggests that rural communities are becoming more diversified and are likely to become more complex in order to develop, and different kinds of individual will need different types of support to be able to make the most of the opportunities that this more complex context enables.

Innovation, “technology transfer” and positive social change: Models and realities of transformation

In this chapter, as noted in the introduction, Vaughan analyses the ways in which people learned, innovated and adopted new practices or technologies in the WIDE communities, and how the prevailing local governance model and interactions in practice were shaping the role of local government and party actors and structures as agents of change. She concludes by stressing the dynamism and importance of local independent community innovation and creativity. This was at odds with the government notion of change being brought about through a uniform administration based on external expertise ‘rolling out’ new packages provided to recipient farmers. This approach had combined with a local governance model, which was, inadvertently but clearly, creating a distance between local leaders and government experts and the community members they were supposed to lead or serve.

Turning to possible policy implications, Vaughan suggests *first* that policymakers may consider the relevance of adjusting the government’s approach to engineering transformation, with a view to making it more flexible, and better able to respond to the wide diversity of further diversifying local rural contexts that the WIDE research illustrates. This calls for recognition that ‘the devil is in the detail’, and respect for locally crafted expertise as being central for successful socioeconomic change, going beyond an approach based largely on ‘seeing like a State’ (Scott 1998) and relying primarily on notions of ‘modern expertise’ and ‘technology transfers’ from outside to ‘change attitudes’.

Second, given the focus placed by the government on local governance and party actors and structures as agents of change, policymakers may want to pay attention to strengthening their efficacy and responsiveness by adjusting local governance relations in a number of ways. These would include: actively avoiding over-concentration of local (*kebele* and sub-*kebele*) responsibilities in a few hands as this can undermine the social relations that are so critical to local learning; strengthening mechanisms engaging women and young people in local government processes and structures, given the importance of these structures in shaping local development processes; examining the roles and relationships involving the *kebele* manager, considering the central role of this role in promoting change; revisiting the effectiveness of the system of 'models', recognising the range of effects other than the intended 'trickle down' that this has on local relationships; and strengthening the capacity and role of the local judicial and especially representative structures, which the WIDE data suggest have so far been largely unable to play their role of 'checks and balances', with potential implications of executive decisions going unchallenged even when they are not popular rather than building consensus.

Third, Vaughan suggests, there is a need to rethink approaches to 'attitude change', and to pay attention to people's perceptions of the relationship between development and governance. With regard to both these aspects, what this chapter calls for is an approach that recognises the value of engaging a wide range of local actors as agents of change; encourages and exploits the potential of cases of 'positive deviance' wherever possible; and involves greater participation in designing locally tailored packages that target the specific needs of each community, drawing on the resources and practices of various social institutions.

Finally, Vaughan suggests the value of establishing a series of institutional resources devoted to studying and experimenting with a range of different models of community governance, and with policy practice that can be correlated or associated with effective collective or inclusive learning, innovation and action, which may be just as important as experimentation with agricultural techniques and value chains, or processes of industrial technology transfer.

Policy relevant suggestions from the crosscutting themes

In this section we return to the three broad crosscutting themes and frameworks outlined in the introduction that emerged as being of potential relevance for policymaking and implementation: 1) '*growth, poverty and inequalities*' - a theme at the core of policymaking in Ethiopia; 2) '*space and time*', which are key contextual frameworks of development planning, and 3) '*genderage*' with a focus on women and youth, together representing the majority of the population, whose involvement in development processes, whilst central to the country's aims to reach lower middle income status, has been constrained in various ways.

Growth, poverty and inequalities

Agriculture has always been seen as central to Ethiopia's growth, from the Agricultural Development-Led Industrialisation policy (ADLI) of the 1990s to the Agricultural Transformation Agenda adopted in 2015. More recently, national development strategies have begun to recognise the importance of urbanisation and of a structural transformation of the economy that would ensure that an increasing number of Ethiopian citizens would find worthwhile opportunities in the service and industry sectors, thereby reducing the pressure of population growth on land. Industrialisation, in particular, is a top priority of the GTPII. At the same time, the GTPII still recognises agriculture as a major engine of growth, and highlights the importance of irrigation in maximising its contribution by reducing its reliance on increasingly erratic rain patterns and improving land productivity. This section briefly reviews how these factors played out in the WIDE communities and summarises the related suggestions made in the various chapters.

Agriculture and irrigation in the WIDE communities

Agricultural growth has been actively promoted through extension services with important impacts

of fertiliser and improved seeds and breeds in increasing production and productivity. The WIDE evidence suggests that irrigation has been a key engine of growth in rural communities. However, often the potential of irrigation was less than fully exploited as the costs of the infrastructure investments that would have been required to develop it further went beyond what private individuals were able or ready to shoulder, and government action was limited. This could have changed since 2013 when the WIDE last fieldwork took place. Irrigation features as a high priority on the government agenda, the more so in the current post-drought context¹¹. In its 'deliverables' for the GTPII implementation, the Agricultural Transformation Agency (2016) indicates that it will focus on ensuring better water resource management from the stage of identification of potential through to that of water management in operational schemes; improving infrastructure standards; and raising resources through the establishment of a development fund for small-scale irrigation¹². The government Household Irrigation Sector Strategy (Ministry of Agriculture, n.d.) outlines further measures to strengthen irrigated farming management (on a private or cooperative basis), including aspects of input sourcing, cropping calendar management, output marketing, water management, equipment/scheme maintenance and financial management.

These are important developments. The evidence in this volume suggests that it would be useful, in implementing them, to consider and support the development of different types and scales of schemes, suited to local ecologies or economies. As Vaughan also highlights, in the communities in which it happened, the expansion of irrigation shifted wider economic interests and opportunities locally, triggering innovative practices and change well beyond farmers (allowing new experiences of diverse and/or cash crop production and of wage labour; promoting local market networks and relations with traders; improving diets and food security; and boosting urban linkages). Initiatives to enhance rural job creation could usefully focus on exploiting all these aspects of micro socio-economic change emerging around irrigation – a point Vaughan makes that holds for other similarly emerging farm sector-based opportunities. In turn this, we suggest, may well require advisory capacity beyond that of DAs at present.

Growth, urbanisation and structural transformation at local level

The WIDE research, looking at growth at the local level, supports the case for agriculture remaining a high policy priority, and in particular provides evidence for the importance of irrigation for growth as discussed above. However, in this volume we also highlight the importance of urbanisation and of economic transformation in local economic growth, and suggest that these were strongly inter-linked, with higher growth in better connected and market integrated communities (see e.g. Bevan on urbanisation, and Tefera and Dom on economic success).

We suggest, moreover, that greater attention should be paid to expanding Micro/Small Enterprise support initiatives to rural *kebele* centres – to provide opportunities for the growing numbers of young people with limited access to land (see Pankhurst), further support the increased participation of girls and women in economic activities (see Loveday), open up the range of opportunities available for local entrepreneurs (Tefera and Dom), and further enhance the benefits of the increased urbanisation of the communities (Bevan). The government is indeed paying great attention to the development of Micro/Small Enterprises and has harnessed considerable donor support for this¹³. However, this 'big push' has so far focussed mainly on urban areas. In this volume we show that rural communities should no longer be considered as solely farming economies, and

¹¹ The GTPII foresees that approximately an additional 300,000 ha and 400,000 ha will be developed with medium/large and small-scale schemes, respectively. Also see <http://allafrica.com/stories/201608161198.html> (16 August 2016, accessed 24 September 2016) <http://allafrica.com/stories/201608200416.html> (19 August 2016, accessed 24 September 2016) for instance.

¹² See <http://www.ata.gov.et/programs/sustainable-inclusive-growth/irrigation-drainage/> accessed 12/10/2016.

¹³ An example is the recent US\$ 200 million World Bank project for small and medium enterprise finance (World Bank 2016b).

they need to diversify to grow. Ensuring that support to MSEs reaches out to rural areas would contribute to this diversification and provide an additional pathway to strengthen rural economic growth.

Poverty and inequalities in rural communities

The WIDE research tells a story of considerable, broadly positive change, yet not equally positive for all, so that increased differentiation and inequalities had emerged. In this volume we identify a number of groups of people who were 'left behind' in various ways (e.g. poorer households or individuals unable to escape the trap of low-return economic activities, destitute, vulnerable groups such as orphans and elderly without support, poor women unable to access maternal and infant care, poor children having to dropout from schools etc.). We also show how remoteness was linked with poverty, a theme further discussed below in the section on 'space and time'.

With regard to addressing poverty and inequalities, the PSNP was found to be important in the communities where it was implemented, as well as emergency aid in specific circumstances. However, beyond this there were limited interventions carried out at scale to address the needs of the 'active poor' and support their potential to improve their livelihoods. In most instances it seemed to be assumed that the poor would benefit from the mainstream measures of expansion of services supply (education, health), provision of technologies and inputs (agriculture), credit (access to capital) etc., in the same way as wealthier households/individuals. Yet, the evidence suggests that this was often not the case, due to the constraints they face. Costs (direct, indirect and in terms of trade-offs with other options) prevented children from poor households from attending even primary school, poor women from delivering in safe conditions, youth from poor households from establishing businesses and accessing land and credit etc. And even less was done for the very poor, destitutes, and some of the vulnerable groups such as poor elderly people, who usually depended entirely on support from the community, and some assistance from NGOs and religious charities.

With the recently adopted National Social Protection Policy the government has committed to 'leaving no one behind'. A number of measures, recently agreed or in the process of being scaled-up, have the potential of making a difference in implementing this agenda. This includes an ambitious plan to near-universalise health insurance coverage and intentions to scale up crop and livestock insurance, both measures that can go a long way in supporting the 'working poor', as long as they are adapted to local conditions, involve piloting in different contexts and gradual scaling up, and build in strong community participation from the outset and throughout implementation. For the poorest and most vulnerable, the development of a strategy to implement the Social Protection Policy holds promises, as long as the recruitment, training and deployment of social workers can be promoted and institutionalised, and the approach involves coalitions of different stakeholders within communities.

In this volume we point out a number of other pilots that could be considered for scale-up such as the establishment of sufficiently-resourced Community Care Coalitions and making grants/transfer assets for very poor men and women as a first step towards credit-worthiness; innovative ways of expanding service outreach through ICT-based solutions (discussed below) to address some of the access constraints faced by poor people; and expanding Micro/Small Enterprise support programmes in very small towns and *kebele* centres.

Most importantly, we suggest that what is also needed is a change in mind-set and approaches, in particular on the part of government agents working at the community level. Reaching out to poor and vulnerable people will require "doing things differently" (World Bank 2015); and to start with, understanding their constraints and the rationales underpinning their decisions and strategies, respecting their endeavours and priorities, promoting their efforts to improve their livelihoods and coordinating support with the participation of community institutions.

Change in space and over time

Reducing rural remoteness is a prominent goal on the government agenda, with ambitious infrastructure development plans. The Universal Rural Roads and Access Programme (URRAP) foresees that all *kebele* centres should soon be accessible by an allweather road (Ethiopia Road Authority, undated), and in April 2016 it was reported that URRAP had reached 76% of this target. The government target of 90% access to electricity in 2020 implies a massive expansion from the level of 60 per cent reported for 2014/15 in the GTP II (and some other sources suggest a quite significantly lower level of access¹⁴). *Kebele* access roads and grid-based electrification should over time make the playing field more level between communities. However, in this volume we suggest that complementary strategies are needed, especially with a view to reducing within-community remoteness. As one of these, Bevan makes the case for greater attention to be paid to improving internal roads and paths, which, she suggests, calls for means beyond voluntary community labour (e.g. technical and financial support by *weredas* and paid skilled and unskilled labour so as to accelerate the pace of expansion and ensure better quality works).

Another much promising avenue is the development and widespread expansion of off-grid electrification options, which in turn, would allow powering smartphones, tablets and even laptops, hence giving access to ICT-based solutions in various fields. Bevan makes this point generally in her chapter on urbanisation. This also comes up when she highlights the need for locally tailored and culturally sensitive alternatives to the policy of institutionalised birth deliveries, whose full implementation will take time. One of a range of options, she suggests, would be for HEWs and TBAs to have smartphones to access remotely professional advice from health centres, or through specialised apps¹⁵ that could be developed for this purpose. Dom also sees the case for expanding distance education as a promising way of increasing access, especially to post-primary education levels. Non-grid electricity would also expand the reach of existing solutions such as the agricultural extension hotline of the Ministry of Agriculture (ATA 2015a), as more farmers would have their phone charged when they need the advice. It would provide power for other livelihood- and life-enhancing technology such as irrigation pumps to further expand irrigation (see above); tools for local wood-/metal-work enterprises; grain mills freeing women's time; lighting for studying and powering cool boxes for human and livestock medicines etc.

Non-grid electricity is an option in which the government is showing interest and which is developing with the support of a recently-enacted energy law providing for a greater role for the private sector, ambitious targets in the GTP II, and donor support to help accelerate uptake of a wide range of non-grid powered products (solar lanterns etc.) (Overseas Development Institute 2016). What could also make a significant difference would be linking up these developments to a wider range of ICT-based solutions (e.g. health advice hotline or app, specialised advice modules for the agricultural hotline etc.).

Genderage and experiences of change

We now return to reflecting on the implications of these patterns of change and continuity for two broadly-defined categories of individuals in the WIDE communities: women (with particular emphasis on girls and young women), and the youth in their transition to adulthood. These two groups are both the focus of special attention by the government. However, interventions targeting women and youth often adopt a somewhat 'siloed' approach and rarely consider them more holistically, as genderaged individuals with genderage-specific needs, potentials and constraints, who have to take into account all domains of their life at the same time, as well as the links between

¹⁴ Notably, the World Bank survey on Readiness for Investment in Sustainable Energy in Ethiopia mentions a coverage of 23% of the population in 2013. See <http://rise.worldbank.org/data/exploreconomies/ethiopia/2014>

¹⁵ See for example the Safe Delivery App tested in Ethiopia in 2014 by the Maternity Foundation <http://maternity.dk/the-safe-delivery-app/>

these when they make decisions. This, we believe, needs to change. For instance, the policy discourse and practice generally overlooks that ‘women’ and ‘youth’ are overlapping categories, as this volume clearly shows. In this section we consider each category successively, but the discussion should hopefully highlight the overlap between them.

Women and girls

We have seen in the introduction that there has been considerable progress on a range of issues related to gender relationships regarding women’s rights, changing social norms, economic participation of women and their access to services. These include changes in relation to marriage and divorce, gender-based violence and harmful traditional practices, access to land and inheritance etc., as well as greater participation of women and girls in economic activities, girls’ education and enhanced access to reproductive health services with positive effects on girls’, mothers’, and babies’ wellbeing, as highlighted by Loveday, Dom and Bevan in the relevant inter-related chapters.

On the other hand, and reflecting at the local level the country’s slow progress in improving its rank in the World Economic Forum (2015) ‘gender gap closure’ index¹⁶, the evidence from WIDE also suggests that there still is a long way to go. That is the case in each of the areas just mentioned (harmful traditional practices, girls’ education etc.), as the authors also noted. More broadly, Bevan explains, the usual ‘silo’ approach to policymaking and implementation means that interventions often focus on one of the women’s multiple roles and ignore the others. Yet, seeing that all of the analyses in this volume have something to say about women and girls, we suggest that gender equality should be addressed in thinking about girls and women as having to make decisions regarding all of their roles simultaneously.

One category, in particular, that appeared to be missed out was rural young women, from their mid-teens to when they become ‘established’ married women. They faced some of the same difficulties as young men to reach adulthood as well as a range of additional gender-specific constraints, notably issues of abduction, rape, constrained access to contraception, unsafe abortions, having a child out of wedlock, and lacking support from the father or their parents, and facing hardships to bring up a child with limited child care support. Gaining a better understanding of the array of decisions they have to navigate regarding education, marriage, livelihood options (including migration), pathways to reach some independence, and the links between these, would provide a sounder basis for developing interventions that support them more effectively in their transitions to adulthood.

In this volume we also suggest that at least three types of factors could accelerate progress towards gender equality: 1) more and improved interventions in education, reproductive health, agricultural extension, youth livelihood development etc. (and we made related suggestions in the relevant chapters); 2) pursuing interventions that enhance broad modernisation forces, such as infrastructure development with its effects in ‘opening up’ rural communities (further discussed above) and; 3) interventions that actively seek to change social norms and male roles and involvement in particular, in ways that recognise concerns that inevitably emerge when considering quite fundamental changes in women and men’s relationships, and that actively enlist support from a wide range of potentially progressive actors.

The younger generation

In a country with more than half the population under the age of 20, youth issues are of particular policy salience with a new Ministry of Youth and Sport recently formed providing opportunities for rethinking youth issues. The WIDE research has revealed serious issues affecting youth, most notably

¹⁶ In 2014 Ethiopia was 124th on a list of 145 countries for which this index was compiled, thus remaining in the bottom 20% worst performing, as it was in 2006.

un(der)employment, limited access to land controlled by the older generation and consequent difficulty in forming households, and constraints on access to reproductive health.

Our suggestions in relation to rural youth involve three main approaches: 1) rebalancing perspectives and recognising the reproductive role of young men and productive role of young women more fully; 2) expanding local livelihood opportunities for the youth and in particular, as part of the 'rural job creation agenda' of the government, expanding Micro/Small Enterprise development programmes to small towns and *kebele* centres; and 3) encouraging and facilitating rural mobility and especially, providing more effective support for young people seeking employment in towns, industry and abroad, for whom this may be the most efficient way to significantly contribute to their home community's development.

Approaches to policy-making and implementation

In this last section we turn to another type of crosscutting issue, no longer focusing on areas for which policy is made and implemented, but on approaches to policy-making and implementation. The current approach, underpinned by a standardised, hierarchical and disciplined system of rolling out development interventions across the government levels, from federal to regions, *weredas* and *kebeles*, was vital in launching Ethiopia's development process. The evidence outlined in this volume supports this. However, it also suggests that the changes and transformations we have documented mean that this same approach is increasingly less effective. In this section we suggest that a number of interlinked design and implementation features, aiming to adapt the approach to the changed and changing context, could further strengthen the effectiveness of interventions.

In this section we briefly summarise, in turn, the following inter-related features that could bring about significant improvements: 1) the value of a holistic approach to policy; 2) the importance of taking account of diversity and contextualising interventions ("one size does not fit all"); 3) the relevance, therefore, of a 'bottom-up' approach, attentive to local knowledge, encouraging local innovation and change processes, allowing space for experimenting with local ideas and with a wide range of options in interventions, and for working with broad coalitions of various kinds of actors with a view to harnessing all potentials, ideas and power, and geared towards more modest but realistic ambitions in implementation.

Adopting a holistic inter-sectoral approach

This volume and other WIDE analyses highlight that when trying to improve development interventions, it is important to understand their sociology and ethnography, as well as their politics and economics. Our starting point in considering change in rural communities is to look at all aspects of life because these constantly interact with and influence one another. This is true too of all development interventions, as noted in the introduction chapter: they interact with local dynamics and wider modernisation processes to produce change and continuity; they also interact among themselves; and while usually targeting one aspect of life or one category of people, they always also affect other aspects/categories as well. Therefore, in order for programmes to address people's inter-related needs and concerns, policymaking and practice too should aim to be holistic.

This would imply, notably, considering the implications of specific sectoral interventions on other sectors and strengthening inter-sectoral and cross-sectoral planning at all levels, with a particular focus on the *kebele* level, where community development plans need to take account of and balancing local priorities. As noted in the introduction, interventions in one sector often have intended or unintended consequences in other sectors, which may have positive or negative effects for different categories of persons. In the previous section we suggested that interventions to support women and youth need to recognise that they do not make decisions or act in one dimension of their life without taking account of the effects on the others. The same logic applies at community level; synergies may occur where interventions support each other, for instance irrigated production of vegetables leading to a more varied diet and better nutrition. Antergies may also

result, where interventions have negative effects on other sectors, such as for instance irrigation leading to the creation of breeding areas for mosquitos resulting in increased malaria.

Another aspect to bear in mind is that interventions compete for resources that individuals and communities have to provide to make them work. As Bevan and Loveday show, time is one such resource for women as individuals; time spent to cook for the family compete with time that could be spent on an economic activity improving the family's diet. Again, the same logic applies when a community has to contribute to a wide array of interventions such as school or road construction, environmental rehabilitation works etc. at the same time as trying to strive economically.

Furthermore, interventions in one domain would be more effective if they took into account all of the community-specific potentials and constraints, which can widely differ across places. For instance, as we saw when looking at irrigation, whilst the technical potential for irrigated onion and tomato production may be similar in two communities, the actual potential in each of them will also depend on how much land is irrigable, the community's cohesiveness (which matters with regard to the type of management modality that may work), the range of other available options, the ease of access to and demand from markets etc.

Adapting approaches flexibly to local contexts

This brings us to the second point – the importance of contextualising interventions and adapting them to local priorities. Common parlance says it all, “one size does not fit all”, since the circumstances, resources, opportunities and constraints differ markedly between communities, households and individuals in a range of ways documented at each level in this volume. For instance, at the community level the context of agro-pastoralist and fairly remote Luqa and Gelcha, somewhat lagging in education and with part of the population more mobile, call for approaches to expanding access that differ from those that could be effective in well-integrated Sirba located on a road between two major cities, where social norms are more likely to support parents sending girls away for post-primary education; or, as we suggest earlier, different types and scales of schemes are needed to maximise the potential of irrigation in the various communities.

We have also suggested that understanding and categorising communities in types is important for development planning: to take one example, priorities to boost economic growth vary with a community's remoteness, perhaps requiring more focus on infrastructure development in those more remote so as to pave the way for economic development; and expanding service outreach in a remote part of a *kebele* cannot be done in the same way as for those living in the centre.

Thinking about households this volume illustrates the need to have different lenses to understand the abilities and constraints of different kinds of household based on wealth, assets and access to resources, the gender and age of the household head, the composition of the household and whether it is on the ‘ideal track’ or has ‘fallen off track’, and its position within the community.

At an individual level there are huge differences between profiles, such as the entrepreneurial character who needs a few hundred thousand *birrs* to realise her next plan, the poor landless woman with young children who is afraid of taking a loan of a thousand *birr*, and a young couple trying to establish itself as an independent household, with some education but no capital. All need to be supported to exploit the economic niches and opportunities that they have, but the kind of support they need is fundamentally different.

What is true in relation to livelihoods is equally true in relation to other inter-related dimensions of these individuals' lives. Thus, understanding local contexts, household characteristics and individual life circumstances is important to be able to tailor interventions and support accordingly, and it is therefore important to build in room for flexibility and local adaptation and definition of how programmes are implemented and coordinated.

Prioritising a grassroots learning, experimental and collaborative approach

As just argued, for interventions to work well it is important that they fit with, and are tailored to, local and individual needs and priorities. This, in turn, requires interventions to be based on understanding of, and listening to, local actors, who are often well aware of the opportunities and constraints in the contexts in which they live, and have their own concerns and priorities. There needs to be a blending of general principles and tailored options (e.g. off-grid electrification as an option to reach out in remoter areas; ICT-based advisory service apps where access to facility-based services or staff is difficult or costly). Government agents need to think about themselves as collaborating with communities and individuals who have their own ways of doing things, usually for good reasons or ones that serve their interests, to whom they bring new perspectives, but from whom they also learn about what can work locally and why; and to recognise the value of tapping into a range of different sources of knowledge, including non-governmental ones (e.g. local immigrants with specific expertise, or ideas that local people pick up elsewhere on migration journeys).

Linking with this last point, in several chapters we highlight the advantages and effectiveness of working with a broad range of stakeholders. For instance, making social protection everyone's concern through mobilising local leaders, iddirs, and NGOs alongside government services and the private sector, as has been piloted with the Community Care Coalitions; enlisting the support of progressive elders, clan and religious leaders alongside government agents and NGOs, in promoting girls' education and stopping practices harming girls and women; reaching out to boys and men in promoting gender equity, including in naming, shaming and intervening against boys and men harming women. Such coalitions involving influential local institutions may be especially effective when aiming to change social norms, with a view to avoid imposing change as this may lead to practices going underground if people are not convinced, as we have noted in several chapters. However, the principle also applies in the economic domain. In this volume we show, for instance, that farming, local business and trade can be mutually beneficial; migration outside of the community can contribute to the community's local development; private inward investment in local factories can complement government interventions to create jobs for the youth. There could well be potential in 'Community Economic Development Coalitions', on the model of the 'Community Care Coalitions', that could work on linking up initiatives by the various actors and explicitly seek to develop local economic synergies.

In turn, contextualisation and collaboration require space, time and commitment, to listen, experiment, tailor action and make it evolve by building coalitions, bearing in mind that interventions can often face resistance from those who are not convinced or whose interests may be detrimentally affected, as we have documented in several chapters. Initiatives need to be piloted, and the results assessed and adapted to local conditions. In addition to a respectful and collaborative approach, it is important to instil a strong sense among front-line extension workers in the various sectors (teachers, DAs, HEWs, and Social Workers), that they are service providers, who should be accountable to their clients as well as to their superiors.

Finally, the points raised above suggest that policymakers and practitioners may need to be ambitious, but differently. Upscaling needs to be implemented cautiously, with room for local adaptation, and building in community-based monitoring and evaluation. There is a need to go beyond ambitious targets focusing on quantifiable results that create excessive pressure on frontline extension workers, and pay greater attention to the way results have been achieved, as well as recognising that experimentation can fail but also have unexpectedly positive results. In turn, this means that there needs to be space, time and processes so that all actors can share lessons from experiences, good and less good ones, and adapt lessons from other contexts to their own. In turn, there is tremendous potential for the more localised, collaborative, incremental and process-oriented policy approaches suggested in this section to considerably enrich the repertoire of policy options and implementation alternatives available to the government and other stakeholders.

It is to be hoped that consideration of the adaptations and changes of approaches to implementing development suggested in this chapter could be part of the answer to ensure that the gains from the period of rapid change and transformation documented in this book are translated into lasting and sustained achievements.

References

- Asnake Kefale & Zerihun Mohammed, 2016, 'Ethiopian Labour Migration to the Gulf and South Africa,' *Forum for Social Studies Monograph No.10*, Addis Ababa: FSS.
- ATA (Agricultural Transformation Agency), 2015a, *Agenda Progress Report covering 2011-15 in the GTPI period*, Addis Ababa: ATA.
- ATA (Agricultural Transformation Agency), 2015b, *GTP2 and the Agricultural Transformation Agenda*, December 2015, Addis Ababa: ATA.
- Bevan, P. & A. Pankhurst, 2007, 'Power Structures and Agency in Rural Ethiopia: Development Lessons from Four Community Case Studies,' paper prepared for the Empowerment Team in the World Bank Poverty Reduction Group, delivered at the Wellbeing in Development Conference, held in Bath June 2016, available at <http://www.welldev.org.uk/conference2007/final-papers/country/formatted-ethiopia.pdf> [accessed 24/11/16].
- Bevan, P., R. Carter & C. Dom, 2013, 'Gebelen and Korodegaga: a tale of two food insecure villages in Tigray and Oromia Regions' in Dessalegn Rahmato, A. Pankhurst & J.-G. van Uffelen (eds), *Food Security, Safety Nets and Social Protection: the Ethiopian Experience*, Addis Ababa: Forum for Social Studies, 363-400.
- Beyero, M., J. Hodge & A. Lewis, 2015, *Leveraging Agriculture for Nutrition in East Africa (LANEA) – Country Report Ethiopia*, Research Program on Agriculture for Nutrition and Health, Rome & Washington D.C.: FAO/IFPRI, available at <http://www.fao.org/3/a-i4554e.pdf> [accessed 25/11/16].
- Boyden, J., A. Pankhurst & Yisak Tafere, 2013, 'Harmful Traditional Practices and Child Protection: Contested Understandings and Practices of Female Child Marriage and Circumcision in Ethiopia,' *Young Lives Working Paper no. 93*, available at <http://www.younglives-ethiopia.org/files/working-papers/working-paper-93> or https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/media/57a08a29e5274a27b2000463/yl-wp93_boyden-et-al.pdf [accessed 24/11/16].
- Cleland, J. *et al.* (forthcoming), *Enhanced employment and productivity: essential conditions for a demographic dividend in Ethiopia*, John Cleland, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, Angela Baschieri, UNICEF Ethiopia, Tassew Woldehanna, Addis Ababa University, Ethiopia.
- Clemens, M., 2014, 'Does Development Reduce Migration?' *CGD Working Paper 359*, Washington, D.C.: Center for Global Development.
- CSA (Central Statistics Agency, Ethiopia), 2014, *Ethiopia Mini Demographic and Health Survey 2014*, available at [http://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/Mini DHS 2014 Final Report.pdf](http://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/Mini_DHS_2014_Final_Report.pdf) [accessed 01/08/16].
- CSA (Central Statistics Agency, Ethiopia), 2011, *Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey 2011*, available at <https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR255/FR255.pdf> accessed 1/8/16 [accessed 01/08/16].
- CSA (Central Statistics Agency, Ethiopia), 2005, *Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey 2005*, Addis Ababa: CSA, available at <http://www.dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR179/FR179%5B23June2011%5D.pdf> [accessed 01/08/16].

- De Regt, M., 2016, *Time to Look at Girls: Adolescent Girls' Migration in Ethiopia*, Research Report for Girl Effect Ethiopia, University of Sussex, Vrije Universiteit of Amsterdam, Terre des Hommes, Destination Unknown, Swiss Network for International Studies (SNIS), Global Migration Centre/The Graduate Institute Geneva, April 2016, Geneva: SNIS, available at http://www.snis.ch/system/files/final_report_ethiopia_may_2016.pdf [accessed 25/11/16].
- Ege, S., 2015, 'the New Economy: Agricultural Transformation in North Shäwa,' Ethiopia, draft prepared for the 19th International Conference of Ethiopian Studies, Warsaw, August 2015, cited with the author's permission.
- Engel, J., 2011, *Ethiopia's progress in education: a rapid and equitable expansion of access*, J. Engel with support from P. Rose, London: Overseas Development Institute, Development Progress, available at <https://www.odi.org/publications/5058-ethiopia-education-equitable-access-development-progress> [accessed 25/11/16].
- Erulkar, A., 2013, 'Early marriage, marital relations and intimate partner violence in Ethiopia,' in *International Perspectives on Sexual and Reproductive Health*, **39** (1): 6–13.
- Guday Emerie & Eshetu Ewnetu, 2016, 'Changing and Hidden Aspects of Early Marriage Arrangements among Peasant Communities of Amhara Region: the Case of Fogera Woreda in South Gondar,' in A. Pankhurst, Yeraswork Admassie & Yitayew Alemayehu (eds), *The Rights of Children in Ethiopia: Empirical Investigations from Multidisciplinary Perspectives*, Addis Ababa: Centre for Human Rights, Addis Ababa University.
- FDRE (Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia), 2016, 'Ethiopia's Overseas Employment Proclamation,' *Proclamation* No.923/2016, Addis Ababa 19 February 2016.
- FDRE (Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia), 2015a, 'Prevention and Suppression of Trafficking in Persons and Smuggling of Migrants Proclamation,' *Federal Negarit Gazetta* Proclamation No.909/2015, Addis Ababa, 17 August 2015.
- FDRE (Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia), 2015b, *Growth and Transformation Plan II (GTPII) 2015-20*, draft document, September 2015, Addis Ababa: National Planning Commission, available at <https://www.africaintelligence.com/c/dc/LOI/1415/GTP-II.pdf> [accessed 18/08/16].
- FDRE (Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia), 2004, The Criminal Code of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, *Federal Negarit Gazetta* Proclamation, No.414/2004.
- FDRE (Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia), 2000, 'The Revised Family Code,' Proclamation No.213/2000, *Federal Negarit Gazetta* Extra Ordinary Issue No. 1/2000.
- Greatrex, H., J.W. Hansen, S. Garvin, Rahel Diro, S. Blakeley, M. Le Guen, K.N. Rao, D.E. Osgood, 2015, 'Scaling up index insurance for smallholder farmers: Recent evidence and insights,' *CCAFS Report* No.14, Copenhagen: CGIAR Research Program on Climate Change, Agriculture and Food Security (CCAFS), available at <https://cgspace.cgiar.org/rest/bitstreams/38716/retrieve> [accessed 25/11/16].
- Guush Berhane, S. Devereux, J. Hoddinot, J. Hoel, K. Roelen, Kibrewossen Abay, M. Kimmel, N. Ledlie & Thomas Woldu, 2015, 'Evaluation of the Social Cash Transfer Pilot Programme, Tigray Region, Ethiopia,' Report for UNICEF, June 2015, available at http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/user_upload/p2p/Publications/UNICEF_Tigray_Endline_Report.pdf [accessed 24/09/16].
- Habtamu Fuje & Lire Ersado, 2016, 'Rural Non-Farm Economy in Ethiopia,' February 2016, Addis Ababa: World Bank Group.
- Holden, S., & Sozina Bezu, 2014, *Ethiopia Land Access and Youth Livelihood Opportunities in Southern Ethiopia: Summary Report*, report 3/2014, Addis Ababa: UN-Habitat, available at

<http://unhabitat.org/books/land-access-and-youth-livelihood-opportunities-in-southern-ethiopia/> [accessed 25/11/16].

- Honwana, A., 2013, *Youth, waithood and protest movements in Africa*, International African Institute, January 2013, available at <http://africanarguments.org/2013/08/12/youth-waithood-and-protest-movements-in-africa-by-alcinda-honwana> [accessed 25/11/16].
- Jones, N., E. Presler-Marshall & Bekele Tefera with Guday Emirie, Bethelihem Gebre and Kiya Gezahegne, 2014, *Rethinking girls on the move: The intersection of poverty, exploitation and violence experienced by Ethiopian adolescents involved in the Middle East 'maid trade'*, December 2014, London: Overseas Development Institute, available at <https://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/9307.pdf> [accessed 25/11/16].
- Lenhardt, A., A. Rogerson, F. Guadagno & T. Berliner, 2015, *One foot on the ground, one foot in the air – Ethiopia's delivery on an ambitious development agenda*, Development Progress series, London: Overseas Development Institute, available at <https://www.odi.org/publications/9884-ethiopia-progress-development-mdgs-millennium-development-goals-employment-agriculture-extreme-poverty-education> [accessed 25/11/16].
- Ministry of Agriculture, n.d., *Realising the Potential of Household Irrigation in Ethiopia (Household Irrigation Sector Strategy)*, Working Strategy Document, Addis Ababa: Federal Ministry of Agriculture and Agricultural Transformation Agency.
- Ministry of Education, 2016, *Fifth Education Sector Development Programme 2015/16 – 2019/20*, Addis Ababa: Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.
- Ministry of Health, 2015, *Health Sector Transformation Plan 2015/16-2019/20*, Addis Ababa: the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.
- MWCYA (Ministry of Women, Children and Youth Affairs), 2014, *National strategy on harmful traditional practices (HTPs) against girls, women and children*, Addis Ababa: Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia.
- O'Neil, T., A. Fleury & M. Foresti, 2016, 'Women on the move: migration, gender equality and the SDGs,' *Briefing Papers*, July 2016, London: ODI, available at <https://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/resource-documents/10731.pdf> [accessed 25/11/16].
- Overseas Development Institute, 2016, 'Accelerating access to electricity in Africa with off-grid solar – Off-grid solar country briefing: Ethiopia,' January 2016, London: ODI, available at <https://www.odi.org/publications/10200-accelerating-access-electricity-africa-off-grid-solar> [accessed 25/11/16].
- Pankhurst, A., Agazi Tiumelissan & Nardos Chuta, 2016, 'The Interplay Between Community, Household and Child Level Influences on Trajectories to Early Marriage in Ethiopia: Evidence from Young Lives,' *Young Lives Working Paper*, no.162, available at <http://www.younglives.org.uk/sites/www.younglives.org.uk/files/YL-WP162-Pankhurst.pdf> [accessed 24/11/16].
- Pankhurst, A. & F. Piguet (eds), 2009, 'Displacement, Migration and Relocation: Challenges for Policy, Research and Coexistence', in A. Pankhurst & F. Piguet (eds), *Moving People in Ethiopia: Development, Displacement and the State*, Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer/OxfordL James Currey, East African Series, 249-264.
- RMMS (Regional Mixed Migration Secretariat), 2016, *Ethiopia Country Profile*. Updated May 2016, Nairobi: RMMS.

- Scott, J., 1998, *Seeing Like a State: how certain schemes to improve the human condition have failed*, New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Tassew Woldehanna & Aregawi Gebremedhin, 2016, 'Learning Outcomes of Children Aged 12 in Ethiopia: A Comparison of Two Cohorts,' *Young Lives Working Paper*, no.152, available at <http://www.younglives.org.uk/sites/www.younglives.org.uk/files/YL-WP152-Learning%20outcomes%20in%20Ethiopia.pdf> [accessed 24/11/16].
- UNICEF, 2012, *Investing in boys and girls in Ethiopia: past, present and future*, Addis Ababa: UNICEF, available at https://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/ET_sitan_2012.pdf [accessed 25/11/16].
- UNICEF, 2013, 'Community-Based Nutrition,' UNICEF Ethiopia *Briefing Note*, December 2013, available at <https://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/2014-12-15-NUTRITION-based.pdf> [accessed 25/11/16].
- van Heelsum, A., 2016. Why migration will continue: aspirations and capabilities of Syrians and Ethiopians with different educational backgrounds, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 39:8, 1301-1309.
- Villanucci, A. & E. Fantini, 2016, 'Santé publique, participation communautaire et mobilisation politique en Éthiopie : la Women's Development Army,' in *Politique Africaine*, special issue, 'L'Éthiopie Après Meles' 2016/2 (142).
- World Bank, 2015, *Ethiopia Poverty Assessment 2014*, Poverty Global Practice Africa Region, Report No. AUS6744, January 2015.
- World Bank, 2016a, *Ethiopia Public Expenditure Review*, Report No: ACS14541.
- World Bank, 2016b, *Project Appraisal Document on a Proposed Credit in the Amount of SDR 144.8 million (US\$200 million equivalent) to the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia for a Small and Medium Enterprise Finance Project*, April 26, 2016, Report No.PAD 1650.
- World Economic Forum, 2015, *The Global Gender Gap Report 2015*, Insight Report, 10th Anniversary Edition.