LONG TERM PERSPECTIVES ON DEVELOPMENT IMPACTS IN RURAL ETHIOPIA

CHANGING INEQUALITIES IN RURAL ETHIOPIA: DIFFERENTIAL IMPACTS OF INTERVENTIONS AND EXCLUSIONS

SHORT SUMMARY

September 2011



Alula Pankhurst with assistance from Rebecca Carter and Agazi Tiumelissan

Contents

l.	Conceptualising differential Impacts and exclusions	1
II.	Inequalities at different levels	1
A.	Inter-Community inequalities	1
B.	Intra-Community inequalities	4
C.	Inter-Household inequalities	5
D.	Intra-Household Individual level inequalities	8
III.	Dimensions of exclusion	9
IV.	Differentials and exclusions in the domains and fields of action	12
V.	Towards an improved Differentials-Exclusion framework	21
VI.	Policy and Practice Implications	23

1. This paper is based on research carried out in six communities in four regions of Ethiopia in 2010. To understand changes it also draws extensively on earlier research mainly in four of these communities from 2003 to 2005 as well as community profiles going back to 1995.

I. Conceptualising differential Impacts and exclusions

- 2. The framework developed considers four levels of inequalities, four underlying factors, and four dimensions of exclusions, all of which interact.
- 3. Inequalities in rural Ethiopian may be considered at **four interconnected levels**: 1) intercommunity, 2) intra-community, 3) inter-household and 4) intra-household.
- 4. Inequalities can be conceived of as based on **four major interrelated factors**: 1) location, 2) gender-age, 3) wealth and poverty, and 4) other statuses.
- 5. Exclusions are considered in term of **four intertwined dimensions**: 1) economic, 2) social, 3) cultural and 4) political.

II. Inequalities at different levels

A. Inter-Community inequalities

- 6. **Differences between communities** were discussed in the main report under the following **ten headings**: 1) Regional variations in policies and implementation, 2) Urban linkages; 3) Development services; 4) Core livelihood system; 5) Diversification; 6) New agricultural technologies; 7) Cultural differences; 8) Social inequality; 9) Social integration and 10) Government-society relations. The implications of each of these parameters for different types of household and individual have been discussed in this paper.
- 7. These 10 parameters may be conveniently regrouped into **three broad areas**: 1) Government-community relations, 2) Livelihoods and urban linkages, and 3) Socio-cultural context. Although this paper focuses more on the third of these the second area and to a lesser extent the first is also relevant to differentiation within communities, and all ten parameters have a bearing on inequalities and exclusions to varying degrees.
- 8. Regarding community types **key distinctions** relate to: 1) relations with government and markets, 2) urban proximity and integration with services, and 3) the degree of homogeneity of the community. These lead to a typology along these **three variables with two types** in each case: 1) dependent versus independent economies, 2) remote versus integrated sites, and 3) homogenous versus heterogeneous sites.

- 9. **Regional policy differences** on land, extension services in livelihoods, education and health, and on gender issues to mention just a few can play out in different ways for communities, households and individuals, of which there are traces in the paper, although this had not been the focus of the this phase of the study.
- 10. <u>Urban proximity and integration</u> is a key parameter. There is a clear distinction between on the one hand sites that are peri-urban or on main roads and integrated with services and on the other those which are more remote and less integrated. Inequalities have been growing faster in the former leading to elites controlling trade and quasi class formation; however, even in remote sites where irrigation offers more opportunities, distinctions have increased and many of those with access to irrigation have prospered more rapidly.
- 11. **Elites** have become differentiated through better productive resources, quality and some luxury consumer goods, and improved use of health and education services including private services.
- 12. The proximity of the integrated sites to urban centres, however, also offer opportunities for non-farm and off-farm income and wage labour for the **poor**, **landless**, **especially the youth**, and for **women** to gain income notably through petty trade and sale of food and beverages.
- 13. Even in the **remoter sites** the development of wereda towns and improving road infrastructures are providing some **petty trading and entrepreneurial opportunities** for households able to sell surpluses and engage in income-generating activities to do better than other households in the communities.
- 14. Development services can be distinguished between two types of communities: dependent and independent. The three drought prone sites are highly dependent on assistance two of them through the Productive Safety Net (PSNP) and the third through food for work. The PSNP direct support played a key role for vulnerable categories notably the elderly enabling them to survive hunger. The food provided through PSNP public works was also extremely useful for poorer households allowing them to overcome seasonal food shortage hunger and preventing distress asset sales, notably of livestock, and providing a buffer against shocks. For better off households who were included the PSNP was one constituent of diversified livelihoods. There were cases of inclusion of wealthier households partly due to a community ethic of sharing resources widely, although there were also some allegations of nepotism. There were also some cases of exclusion of poor households without connections to people in power, notably some female headed households. Packages and credit were more useful for wealthier households, enabling them to increase productivity. However, implementation problems included pressure in some sites to take packages such as fertiliser, goats, and beehives which proved risky in drought prone sites, leading to indebtedness of households with less resource to cope.
- 15. The three sites **with independent economies** had limited social protection and extension services tended to cater for wealthier generally male-headed households. However, **differentiation** leading to some households become wealthy occurred more in activities not covered by extension services such as sale of eucalyptus and chat and grain trading.
- 16. Improvements in health facilities and services have brought about significant changes in access in all sites, particularly the remoter ones. However, equipment and services are often limited and costs remain a concern for very poor households and those in remoter parts of the sites. Richer households particularly in the more integrated wealthier sites have been able to afford private health care in towns. Preventative health packages introduced recently with the posting of the Health Extension Workers (HEWs) have been important particularly for women, and especially mothers and children. However, there were shortages reported and some resistance to vaccinations in certain sites, and health cost exemptions for the very poor were either non-existent or had become overly bureaucratic and ineffective.

- 17. The massive **expansion of primary schools** resulted in more marked changes in the three remote sites where services were previously more limited. The **enrolment of girls** has surpassed that of boys. However, opposition to full-day primary school due to household needs for child labour, and to the school calendar results in absenteeism on market days and during peak agricultural work. Despite Increased **secondary** enrolment, **cost for poorer households** and **access for girls** remains an issue, particularly in the remoter sites where travel to school is still a challenge. Technical and Vocational Education and Training centres are now available to students from most sites. A few students have attended **university** in all sites except Dinki, some subsequently obtaining jobs assisting their families. **Boys even from poorer households** have been able to benefit from **free tertiary education**, but few girls have gone beyond secondary school. In the more integrated wealthier sites a **few richer households** have been able to send boys and even girls to **private colleges**.
- 18. **Core livelihood system** differences relate to whether: 1) production is cereal or *enset* based and other key crops are included, 2) they are vulnerable or export sites, and 3) population density and migration are key aspects of the livelihood system.
- 19. There is more evidence of differentiation in **export and cereal sites** notably those with irrigation potential, and **trade** has been the main basis of inequality. **Petty trade** offers opportunities for poorer households and production of **beverages** for women particularly in integrated sites with market proximity. **Daily labour** has become important for **unemployed youth** and increasing rates of pay have benefitted **poorer households and women**, representing a new trend. Poorer youth from all sites **migrate** seasonally to rural and urban areas, men mainly for construction and women to work in bars. New opportunities in flower farms in the Rift Valley have attracted young women. Migration has become a way of life in two of the sites. Some skilled workers have been earning well in towns. Migration to Gulf State, and Sudan has also been a successful strategy but only for a few.
- 20. <u>Diversification</u> has been largely related to **irrigation** potential which was been prominent in two sites and recently started on a smaller scale in three other sites. Involvement in **trade** has been a major basis for growing inequalities particularly in the integrated sites. However, **petty trade** has also been important for survival notably of poorer households and women, with greater opportunities in the integrated sites with urban proximity. Women have also been involved in producing alcohol as an income generating activity. **Daily labour** has increased in frequency and rate of pay, and women have become more involved in wage labour. **Migration** is an important strategy in most sites for the youth and has become a way of life in Girar and Geblen.
- 21. <u>New agricultural technologies</u> have been adopted by enterprising farmers, notably fertiliser and selected seeds in most sites, improved livestock breeds in some, tractor hire, broad-bed makers and manual threshers in a few. However, there have been serious problems with adoption of livestock breeds, which are often not drought and disease resistant, leading to indebtedness of poor farmers.
- 22. Adoption of new technologies is most useful for wealthier male-headed households. Increased prices have put **fertiliser beyond the reach of many poorer households**, and some poorer households became indebted when rains failed. Composting used in some sites requires manure which only wealthier households with sufficient livestock have enough of to use effectively.
- 23. <u>Cultural differences</u> depend on site characteristics. Three of the sites are homogenous in terms of ethnicity and religion, whereas the other three have mixed ethnicities and religions. In two of these sites inequalities are somewhat related to ethnic identity, with differences between economic wealth and political power. In one site migrants from the North are better off whereas migrants from the south are worse off than the native group that control politics.
- 24. There is little evidence of **inequalities based on religion and cultural traditions**. However, Muslim and Argobba cultural traditions in Dinki prevented women from working in fields, and men resisted including names of wives in the land certification invoking Sharia law. There has also been

resistance to outlawing traditions of widow inheritance and discouraging polygyny in Turufe, and more generally to the ban on female circumcision.

- 25. <u>Social inequality</u> between rich and poor, and the older and younger generations, has been growing but gender inequality decreased. The growing distinction between rich and poor is more pronounced in the integrated sites where opportunities for trade, sale of cash crops and diversification of livelihoods has created room for entrepreneurial activity and for elite formation. Some opportunities also emerged in the remoter sites through irrigation and cash crop production.
- 26. Differences between the **older generation controlling resources** and land-less youth is leading to the formation of a class of older landed mainly male-headed households. In the wealthier more integrated sites the elites have been better placed to intensify and diversify production.
- 27. **Gender inequalities have decreased** largely through interventions, relating to women's land rights, promotion of girls' education, women and child-centered health packages, measures countering violence against women and banning harmful traditional practices, although these have provoked some resistance from men.
- 28. <u>Social Integration</u> seems greater in the homogenous sites, though conflict with neighbouring groups is not uncommon and intergenerational tensions are common in all sites. Internal tensions between ethnic groups is largely related to **in-migration**. Recent migrants form an underclass often exploited by employers. In Turufe tensions erupted particularly at times of political instability. In Korodegaga migrants live in poor conditions excluded from services and subject to abuse and victimisation in cases of disputes.
- 29. Occupational **craftworkers** were traditionally **despised and ostracised**. Inequalities were more pronounced in southern Ethiopia and have declined; however some traces remain and intermarriage between craftworkers and farmers is still resisted.
- 30. **Elites** associated with previous regimes were considered over privileged; in Yetmen they had land confiscated in 1997 and were disenfranchised until the 2005 elections but seem to have since been rehabilitated. Individuals associated with opposition in the 2005 elections faced difficulties in a couple of sites.
- 31. **Government-society relations** depend on regional policies and politics and on whether sites are independent or dependent, with state assistance and control more apparent in the latter, and greater leeway in the former. Despite limited evidence some people in authority may be in a position to benefit relatives through inclusion in benefits or avoiding unpopular labour demands.
- 32. The promotion of **gender policies** to protect women from male violence and enable them to assert land rights has been successful though it encountered some resistance notably over harmful traditional practices.
- 33. Measures to counter **discrimination against craftworkers** in Girar and to stop the practice of **'trafficking of girls'** sent to become servants in town were said to be having some effect.

B. Intra-Community inequalities

- 34. Differences within communities relate to: 1) geographical location, settlement and topography 2) access to roads and communications 3) access to water and irrigation, 4) access to administration and services.
- 35. Geographical location settlement and topography within sites affect households differentially; households living close to or within settlements, villagised areas or wereda centres have better access to services notably health centres and schools, infrastructure, water supplies etc. Those living closer to urban areas can benefit from better opportunities for trade and access to urban services, notably mills, electricity, mobile and telephone networks, administration and better health and education services for those who can afford it. Potentially households in peri-urban areas

which are likely to become part of expanding urban areas could face loss of land, though so far only communal land loss was experienced in Turufe. Topography can matter in relation to erosion in sites with escarpments and can affect households with irrigated land as happened in Dinki.

- 36. Access to roads and communications has important implications for opportunities available to households. Those living close to roads have better access to towns and markets especially for transport, and could benefit from roadside development if they do not loose land due to road upgrading as happened in Dinki or due to urban expansion. Better roads and transport has improved communications particularly for emergencies and especially benefitting households who can afford the cost of motorised transport. Telephone wireless networks have become common at Kebele level, but have been superseded by the expansion of mobile networks that had reached parts of all the sites by 2010. In most sites mobiles are still rare, used by merchants, for emergencies, and to contact migrant relatives. However, in the more integrated sites their use is becoming more common.
- 37. Access to water and irrigation is a major source of inequalities particularly in the drought-prone sites, and irrigation is a major diacritical factor differentiating household wealth, since those with access are able to prosper by producing cash crops. Access to clean water is also often related to settlement with villagised parts of communities often better serviced; households living further from water points and protected springs, or near polluted sources, and those unable to afford costs where they are instituted are disadvantaged.
- 38. Access to administration and services is partly a function of the location; those living close to the administrative centres have less far to go for services, which can be critical in the cases of health emergencies, especially complicated deliveries. However access to administrative services is also related to power and connections with people in authority. Households with better connections are able to obtain services more easily and poorer and less well connected households sometimes complain that they do not obtain services promptly or may even be denied services. For female-headed households gender biases also play a role, particularly in cases of land disputes with husbands and sharecroppers or cases of male violence; women often have to go to the wereda level to seek justice, often, though not always, with success.

C. Inter-Household inequalities

- 39. Inequalities between households depend primarily on the following five factors: 1) access to resources, 2) labour composition 3) position on the development cycles and types, 4) shocks faced, and 5) the household's status.
- 40. <u>Access to resources</u>, notably land and livestock and other productive assets is the main source of differences between households. In all sites two categories are particularly disadvantaged: **women household heads** who have fallen off the household cycle due to divorce and death of their spouse, and **youth** who have not been able to get onto the ideal cycle due to parental control of limited resources and limited alternatives.
- 41. Land is unequally distributed with variations between sites. Landlessness is a major constraint for the youth, female-headed, very poor and migrant households. Differences within sites by gender and age of household head are important with significant site variations which are related to cultural land tenure patterns. Women heading households had significantly smaller landholdings than men, and there were more landless women in most sites. However, divorcees had less land than widows. The difference between men and women was less significant in the Oromia sites where a larger proportion of the female-headed households are widows inheriting land on behalf of their children or as second wives. Older men tended to have larger land holdings, and this was particularly the case in the Oromia sites where cultural patterns of polygyny and control of resources by elders are important.

- 42. Women heading households also had fewer oxen and other livestock than men, except in Korodegaga where Oromo traditions of polygyny and widow inheritance meant that some richer men were able to marry additional wives providing them with livestock. Younger men in the Amhara sites had comparative more access to livestock given cultural traditions of endowments on marriage.
- 43. The **integrated sites** with better market connections had **higher average asset indexes** than the remoter less integrated sites. **Female headed households** were more likely to be in the **lower asset quintiles** than male headed households in all sites.
- 44. In addition to the material indices, **qualitative descriptions clearly differentiate between wealth categories** in terms of lifestyles, assets, consumption and expenditure. Whereas the wealthy live comfortable lives, the poor have difficult lives often full of hardships.
- 45. Two types of elites can be distinguished, "traditional" and "modern" elites. The former gained power mainly based on control of land and labour and had greater livestock holdings; the latter more powerful recently emerging elites, have gained their position much more through wealth and control of trade and external links.
- 46. **Destitute** persons are increasing in number, particularly in the integrated sites and rely largely on neighbours and kin and community charity. Community social protection often based on religion is important and the destitute are not considered to be categorically different from others and are generally respected as evidenced by most of the terms used to refer to them.
- **47.** Household labour composition is related to household cycles with households in the early and late phases short of labour. Households in Oromia site are on average larger, which may be associated with polygynous and three generation households. Households with insufficient labour may bring in relatives or adopt children, which is more common among the Oromo, and if richer may employ domestic labourers. Children from poorer relatives may be hired, boys herding and girls helping with household tasks; they may face hardships and lack of care and education and abuse.
- 48. **Agricultural labourers and domestic servants** often complained of unfair treatment by employers. Disputes with migrant labourers who were not paid, and more generally between migrants and residents were common. Women working as servants are particularly at risk of exploitation and abuse including rape by male household members. However in some cases richer households assist poorer labourers as patrons sponsoring them to marry and set up a household.
- 49. <u>Household development cycles and types</u> though common to all sites have cultural variations between the Northern Amhara-Tigrayan type and the Oromo-Southern type, in which polygyny can extend the cycle when a wealthier older male marries a younger second wife. Households can be divided into **two types**: those who remain on the ideal cycle and deviator households who never enter the cycle or fall off it due to death of divorce or abandonment, or are elderly in the late phase living with grandchildren or alone. There is a strong probability of households that have fallen off cycles due to shocks being among the poorer or destitute. Widows and divorcees face particular problems related to access to male labour, land and bringing up children. Men are more likely to remarry after becoming widowers or divorcing.
- 50. <u>Household shocks</u> may be categorised into **four types**: 1) livelihood and reproductive asset shocks, 2) human resources health shocks, 3) social shocks that are household related, and 4) social shocks that are government related. **Livelihood shocks**, particularly drought are the most common in the drought prone sites, whereas **health shocks** including death and illness, **and household related shocks** including divorce and disputes were more commonly reported in the richer integrated sites. **Government-related shocks** such as confiscation of property, imprisonment, ethnic and political discrimination, resettlement and war were relatively rare, and also reported more frequently in the integrated sites.
- 51. **Poorer and destitute** households report a greater proportion of human resource health shocks. Fire, loss of jobs and debt, divorce and theft and disputes were more commonly reported

among the extremely poor. Often multiple shocks combine leading to downward spirals of impoverishment and even destitution. **Wealthier households** are better able to withstand shocks notably drought, whereas poorer and elderly households are more vulnerable and resort to wage labour and seasonal migration to cope. Loss of livestock especially oxen can require households to give land to sharecroppers leading to impoverishment.

- 52. **Costs of illness** can lead to indebtedness and even to the possibility of exclusion from institutions. Deaths often follow high expenses for illness treatment and involve high costs for funerals, though some of this is borne by burial associations which explains willingness of even poor households to invest in regular *iddir* payments. Some households may suffer serious consequences if multiple deaths occur. **Divorce** is a more serious shock for women as they tend to leave the house and have difficulty establishing claims to property and even if successful require male labour.
- 53. <u>Household status</u> tends to be associated with the household head. The gender and age of the household head are inter-related with wealth though this is partially mediated by cultural patterns. **Other statuses** were related to 1) ethnicity and religion, 3) clan identities, 3) residence status, and 4) occupational "caste.
- 54. **Ethnicity** is important in power relations in two of the three heterogeneous sites, and is interrelated with migration histories, wealth and politics. There is a correlation between ethnicity and religion but the overlap is not complete. Religious identities were important in relation to education and women's rights.
- 55. **Clanship** is very important for the Arssi Oromo, with certain clans claiming superior status, respect or precedence, numerical predominance, prior land rights or precedence in the *gada* age grading institution. Its significance has declined but it is still important in murder cases, with group responsibility for blood compensation payments, and also to some extent for bridewealth payments.
- 56. **Residence status** can matter and distinctions are drawn for some purposes in some sites between **natives** (*balager*) and **immigrants** (*mete*), with the later looked down upon by the former. Recent in-migrants may not have rights of access to resources and services, except where they have been long established, and may face discrimination.
- 57. In all sites there are small **craftworker minorities** involved in non-farming occupations including smiths, potters, in some cases tanners and weavers. Apart from the last category they tend to be despised, and interaction with them is constrained. However, in some sites households combining craftwork with agriculture have improved their livelihoods and discrimination has declined although marriage is still unheard of except among migrants.
- 58. Other skilled occupations such as those of carpenters, masons, and tailors in all sites may be means to becoming relatively wealthy involving occasional or seasonal work in urban areas.
- 59. **Former slaves** descended from Southerners brought to the Amhara Region to work during the Imperial regime have been despised and looked down upon by the *chewa* of "noble birth" and even by the craftworkers. Former tenants and herdsmen may also be considered somewhat inferior.
- 60. However, other household statuses are often related to genderage and wealth. **Powerful older men** often belong to dominant status groups. Criteria for elite status include wealth, occupation of key community roles such as dispute settlement, leadership in local organisations, education, and religious office. Powerful men can mobilise collective 'power with' in kin, neighbour, friendship, and clan and/or ethnic networks. Mobilised status groups may use 'power against' other status groups in processes of exclusion which may lead to conflict.
- 61. **Women, younger uneducated men, and poor men** have less access to resources and little say in community affairs, although female relatives of powerful men may have informal influence and there are official positions for women in *kebele* structures and women who occupy these positions and take a lead in organising women for collective women's activities.

D. Intra-Household Individual level inequalities

- 62. **Gender and age** are inextricably linked and the fundamental aspects of intra-household power relations and inequalities, so that we have taken to referring to the two concepts together as genderage.
- 63. **Key life stages** include: infants; kneechildren; roaming children; learning/working children; adolescents; very young adults, mature adults; and declining adults. This paper has focused on the general categories of children, adults and elderly, with the companion paper by Bevan (2011) providing a detailed analysis of youth.
- 64. In the four sites surveyed in 2004 somewhat over half the population was under twenty. In the remoter sites almost one in five persons was under the age of six; in the integrated sites notably Yetmen the proportion was smaller which may be associated with increasing use of contraception.
- 65. For children the **gender is relevant from the beginning** with preferences and greater celebrations for boys. Girls are encouraged from an early age to be submissive and obedient and boys to be assertive. From the age of six children are expected to make a contribution to the household economy. As they grow older gender differences emerging with boys more involved in herding and girls fetching water.
- 66. Many of the problems facing infants relate to the circumstances of their mothers with poverty, marital status, and occupation of women having a bearing on their childrearing. The main problems reported in raising infants relate to feeding them and dealing with their illnesses. Reported causes of harm to babies included poor health and care of mother during pregnancy, illnesses, inability to care for and feed the baby, starvation or poor diet, lack of care due to poverty and not getting medical treatment at the right time. Many of these relate to poverty, marital status and work.
- 67. **Problems facing children** are much more severe for those in poorer households. Nutritional failures, diseases, and the lack of appropriate medical care are common problems but most problematic for infants and small children. The norm is for **children to start work** at around the age of 6; though some child work is necessary for household survival and much of the work may not be harmful, working/learning children may expected to do work 'beyond their capacity' in terms of strength and may not get access to education. They may not get their meals at the right times and shortage of clothes and food may be a problem, particularly in times of drought in the remote sites.
- 68. Regarding **education**, in 2004 there was no gender difference in studying in the integrated sites, whereas in the remoter sites particularly Dinki there were more males in schooling. By 2010 these differences were reduced. **Poverty affects education**. Children from very poor and migrant households, and of labourers or servants, and of households that have fallen off the household cycle may not get access to schooling and be sent to work with relatives. However, there is also evidence that some wealthier households may keep some children away from school due to household labour needs.
- 69. There is a higher proportion of **girls in primary school** suggesting a greater need for male labour; however at secondary level the situation is reversed with far fewer girls attending reflecting gender biases and assumptions about domestic roles for women.
- 70. The condition of the youth and the dilemmas, the opportunities and constraints they face are the subject of the companion paper by Bevan (2011). Gender differences become accentuated among **adolescents** and with potential sexual activity the differences become most salient with greatly increased risks for girls and young women of abduction, rape, forced marriage, and not finding a husband. **Inequalities between the youth** depend in part on parental ability and willingness to endow children which is also mediated by cultural traditions. In particular regarding access to land traditions of endowing sons with land in Amhara sites made a difference although land scarcity is making this less feasible.

- 71. Young men and women who reach adulthood are frequently contributing to the household economy while trying to establish themselves as adults in an environment with insufficient farming opportunities for all. In the remote sites there are few off-farm opportunities, and in the integrated sites great competition for the opportunities that exist leading to unemployment and underemployment particularly for males.
- 72. Differences between adults depend largely on gender, the status of the household, and whether the adult is a household head, spouse or other dependent. Within households **dependents** have limited say in decision-making and restricted access to resources and services.
- 73. In **old age** the main risk is lack of support and losing control of resources to guarantee that support, once the effects of ageing become felt; these include reduced mobility and inability to work, loss of faculties, especially sight and hearing and memory, loss of teeth, risks of physical injury and slow recovery.
- 74. **Wealth differences** are important in old age. Whereas the wealthy may retain allegiance of children and/or employ labourers, ideally a male labourer for field work and a girl for domestic help in fetching wood and water, cooking and cleaning, the poor have to rely on help from children and grandchildren, and those who do not have relatives or offspring willing to help may become destitute and have to rely on charity of neighbours and richer members of the community. The **share-cropping out of land** operates as a form of social protection for elderly and sick people. While sons have the main responsibility for the care of parents in old age there may be close personal relationships between mothers and daughters. It was reported that fathers living with daughters may not be looked after properly.
- 75. **Gender differentials in old age** relate largely to control of resources. **Elderly women** living on their own need the help of sons (or sons-in-law) to plough their fields if they have land as widows and have retained control if it. Otherwise they have to give land to a sharecropper unless they are exceptionally rich and can employ a labourer. But old women living alone also need household help of a younger female relative, preferably a grand-daughter. Ideally they have both adult male and adolescent female help, otherwise they may face destitution. **Poor elderly women** may be involved in low status activities such as collecting mature and preparing threshing floors with dung. If they do have adult children living close once they become too old to live on their own they may live with one of their children and may be well looked after. However, living with a married child means losing their independence and they may not get on with their daughter-in-law or son-in-law. **Elderly men** living on their own also need help of sons (or son in laws) and face the decision of when to hand over control over property. Elderly men may find their standard of living declining whereas that of the younger generation of helpers improves. Elderly men without sons or sons-in-law to help are reduced to giving out their land to sharecroppers and may give out their cattle on a share-use basis and their oxen in exchange for grain at terms that may be unfavourable.
- 76. **Health issues** become more important with old age. Several of the women heading households interviewed were elderly and appreciated health services and mentioned problems especially with high blood pressure, failing eyesight, and falling and breaking limbs. Inability to afford health care was mentioned by elderly persons. The **direct support** through the productive safetynet has been very important for the survival of elderly in the food insecure sites. Due to infirmity and attitudes towards old age the elderly in practice are not easily able to get **access to development services**. For instance in Geblen they were specifically mentioned as excluded from getting packages loans, which was considered unfair by some.

III. Dimensions of exclusion

The literature on exclusion has focused on **social exclusion** and derives from a **western social science tradition.** The concept has been applied more broadly in developing and Third World

contexts. Despite the emphasis on the social dimension, related cultural exclusions, deeper economic exclusions and more directly politically-related exclusions are equally if not more significant in some contexts and/or for certain groups or categories of persons.

- 77. This paper considers **four dimensions** of exclusion: 1) economic, 2) social, 3) cultural, and 4) political. These different forms of exclusion affect particular groups of people or specific types of household or defined categories of person in relation to their attributed statuses. These four dimensions are often interrelated and certain categories suffer from multiple forms of exclusion.
- 78. Some forms of exclusion are more general throughout the sites and concern **categories of person with specific statuses** such as servants or adult dependents within households, though the status of later is largely mediated by gender and wealth.
- 79. Categories of household facing **site specific exclusions** include non-residents in Korodegaga, landless female-headed households in Dinki, recent migrant labourers in Turufe, homeless persons in Yetmen, potters in Girar, and households loosing land to communal grazing in Geblen which do not occur or are less serious in other sites.
- 80. <u>Economic exclusion</u> is related to inequalities and tends to be a manifestation of forms of unequal distribution of resources. Differences in land and livestock holdings, access to irrigation land, and other productive assets result in significant de-facto economic exclusions, particularly affecting the very poor and destitute with genderage dimensions.
- 81. The focus of **agricultural extension services** on male and richer farmers tends to exclude the poor, landless youth and women. **Credit services** may exclude those considered not to be creditworthy who are often poor households, youth, women, and the elderly. Initiatives providing credit to the poor and women by prioritising them or involving criteria specifically including them are useful if well designed. However, there are dangers of indebtedness, particularly with loans for livestock in the drought prone sites.
- 82. Some forms of poverty resulting from inequalities lock certain categories of person into extreme forms of class-like inequalities. The status of household labourers/servants is mediated by genderage and sometimes related to household cycle shocks and may be inherited. Children of persons in these categories face further exclusions notably in relation to access to education and health care. Migrants without access to resources rely largely on selling their labour on exploitative terms in risky and uncertain conditions.
- 83. <u>Social exclusion</u> relates to the social status of categories of person and is often linked to the economic inequalities. Genderage categories often channel and restrict access to resources. Youth, women heading households, the elderly and dependents tend to have less access to land and other resources. Exclusion from forms of **social organisation**, networks and associations is partly related economic exclusion, due to inability of the poor to afford membership fees, or the cost of sponsoring work parties.
- 84. **Social inclusion and protection** of destitute persons and those with illnesses and disabilities, through religious institutions provides charity particularly on holy days. However, exclusion of people with disabilities such as those with leprosy, mental illness and recently people with HIV/AIDS was reported.
- 85. **Interventions** may **reinforce social exclusion** by not considering genderage, ignoring needs of specific categories, or defining criteria for assistance using unpopular modalities. The focus of packages and credit on agricultural options tend to exclude women, many of whom are more involved in income generating activities through trade, food and beverage production and craftwork. The provision of credit in groups may exclude women unless they form women only groups, and the poor since richer farmers may fear being associated with them. Attempts to involve youth in group activities may be difficult to organise and run counter to wishes for individual enterprise.

- 86. **Affirmative Interventions** aimed at countering social problems or benefiting disadvantaged categories may have **unintended negative consequences** and/or **face resistance and increase social friction**. The application of laws asserting women's land rights led to some tensions where daughters claimed land against brothers and divorced men had non-viable plots of land after divorce settlements. Where women took land cases to court this often led to lengthy costly proceedings increasing household tensions.
- 87. <u>Cultural exclusion</u> is linked to identity markers and norms related to ethnicity and/or religion and cultural traditions. These maybe linked to local traditions and gender, as in the case of Argobba women who are barred from working in fields, or local politics as in the case of migrants in Turufe and Korodegaga. The hardening of religious identities has led to the split of institutions such as funeral associations in multi-religious sites, leading to exclusions.
- 88. **Craftworkers** were considered as quasi-caste groups with whom social interaction was constrained. Ostracism and discrimination have declined especially where craftworkers have been able to improve their livelihoods by combining craftwork with agriculture, and campaigns asserting their rights have contributed to change. However, cultural prejudice persists and intermarriage still is unthinkable except in cases of migration.
- 89. Interventions aimed at redressing inequalities related to gender and culture have met with resistance. Interventions to prevent female genital cutting and early marriage were perceived to go counter to local traditions and bans were sometimes circumvented by various means. Attempts to stop polygyny and widow inheritance in Oromia sites faced opposition from men. Argobba men resisted including wives in land certificates on grounds of Sharia law.
- 90. <u>Political exclusion</u> has involved categories associated with previous regimes who had land confiscated in the 1997 land distribution in Amhara, and were denied involvement in politics until the 2005 elections after which they were seemingly rehabilitated. Individuals seen to have been involved in opposition in the 2005 elections were said to have faced problems in some sites.
- 91. **Indirect political exclusion** involves individuals without connections to persons in authority, often related to poverty and gender. In the aid-dependent sites cases of exclusion from assistance were reported. Conversely some individuals with connections received benefits despite being wealthy, notably in relation to inclusion in the safetynet programme.
- 92. **Interventions** seeking to redress inequalities and target the poor may run into contradictions with ways in which local power structures and personal interests of those in positions of authority reinforce inequalities and privileges. Moreover, a community ethic of sharing resources more widely rather than focusing assistance on a few leads to a clash of approaches between frameworks based on targeting the most needy and community ethics of solidarity and sharing resources equally, irrespective of wealth.
- 93. Exclusions can be related to **household characteristics**. The poor and destitute may face economic exclusion due to limited access resources, social exclusion due to inability to pay membership fees, and political exclusion due to lack of connections with those in power. Genderage aspects of household characteristics reinforce exclusions with women and elderly household heads at greater risk, and with less capacity to benefit from interventions.
- 94. **Household statuses** such as that of migrants, and craftworkers may limit entitlements to resources and ability to benefit from services, such as provisions for health care exemptions. Households in the early and late stages of the cycle and those who have fallen off the ideal cycles and have suffered from shocks face greater risks of exclusions.
- 95. Exclusions are also related to **individual gender characteristics** combined with genderage, wealth and other status. Categories at risk include children of very poor households and servants, adolescents from poor and migrant or craftworker households, very poor adults, migrants and those remaining dependents and not forming their own households, adults facing shocks such as illnesses,

accidents and disabilities, divorced and widowed persons, and elderly without support and with disabilities, especially elderly women living on their own. s

96. Section 3 presents outlines of the six communities, with sub-sections on differentials and exclusions relating to each site.

IV. Differentials and exclusions in the domains and fields of action

- 97. Section 4 considered differentials and exclusions in the five domains or fields or action identified in the WIDE research: 1) human re/production, 2) livelihoods, 3) social reproduction, 4) cultural ideas, and 5) community governance.
- 98. **Human Reproduction**. Issues in this field are considered in relation to: 1) Genderage and life cycles, 2) Health differentials and interventions, and 3) Education differential and exclusion risks.
- 99. **Genderage and lifecycles**. Through the individual life cycle interventions in different sectors are more salient at different ages for each of the sexes. For children just after birth the issue of female circumcision, in early childhood the question of nutrition, health care, vaccinations and child care, and as children grow access to education are major areas where interventions matter. In late adolescence sexuality and, for young women, issues to do with reproductive health, and interventions to counter male violence, and for young men access to land and opportunities for obtaining independent income and establishing a separate household become key areas where interventions are relevant. For adult men opportunities for expanding their production and sources of income and for women issues around bearing children and child care, domestic labour and income-generating activities are important. For the elderly food security, health care and social protection are key areas of concern.
- 100. In the campaigns against traditions defined as harmful female circumcision practiced shortly after birth in Amhara sites has not been as much of a focus of campaigns as early marriage; in contrast female genital cutting carried out on adolescent girls prior to marriage in the Oromia and Southern sites have been the focus of fairly successful campaigns which, however, have generated resistance.
- 101. For early childhood questions of **nutrition**, **vaccinations and child care** have been crucial areas for intervention. Much of the Health Extension Package has focused on mother and child health care, and this has been a key role of the HEWs. There seem to have been improvements in nutrition. Though **supplementary feeding** is targeted to malnourished children, there is a tendency to share the food more widely within the family, and a sense expressed that it should be provided for all children; in some sites children from better off households with connections were included. **Vaccinations** have become routine and institutionalised, though resistance was noted in the Amhara sites, and in Dinki partly as mothers' vaccination was suspected of disguising family planning.
- 102. As children grow access to **education** becomes the most salient area where interventions matter. Regarding **pre-school** some richer households in the more integrated sites close to towns have sent children to private kindergartens. Impressive changes in **primary school access** have followed massive expansion and building of satellite schools, resulting in noteworthy gains especially in **girls' primary education.** However, some children still do not go to school as their labour is needed for the household's survival. These are sometimes but not always from poor households and/or households that have fallen off track due to death or divorce of parents, and they may be sent to richer households to work as herders. Some households including wealthier households may not send one child to school to look after livestock. Children's **absence from school** is partly related to the need for child labour in peak agricultural seasons but also depends on the household labour profile.

- 103. Gender difference become more salient with adolescence, and older girls and young women face **risks around sexuality, marriage, pregnancy, birth-giving and child-rearing**, and interventions aimed at changing gender relations begin to have a central role.
- 104. For **young women** risks of abduction, rape, unwanted pregnancies and abortions, and contracting HIV/AIDS become salient, and interventions around access to contraceptives and gender-based violence become crucial. **Abduction** was mentioned as a reason for girls not continuing with schooling. However, strong measures, including imprisonment of men involved in abductions were said to be having some effect. "Voluntary abduction" or elopement of couples to avoid parental decision-making and customary bridewealth payments in the Oromia sites.
- 105. Young men also face risks related to sexuality notably in relation to risks of contracting HIV/AIDS and violence particularly in getting into fights. However, the main issues for them is access to land and un(der)employment, and interventions relating to youth access to land and employment and cooperatives are particularly important for them.
- 106. For **women** risks around child-birth are important with maternal mortality a real threat. Though health posts are beginning to offer perinatal services, lack of equipment and training of health workers and local preferences mean that most women still give birth at home. Improvements in transport in the integrated sites can be crucial in cases of complications. Contraception is probably bringing about important changes though access to it is not as easy in the remoter sites and opposition from men was mentioned. For instance in Girar men expressed resentment at the role of the Health Extension Workers in this respect. A major risk for women is divorce which is particularly common in the Amhara sites. Interventions to protect women's rights to land can lead to women asserting their claims; however, due to virilocal residence many women prefer to return to their parents, and even if they remain face difficulty accessing male labour, and/or finding other sources of income and obtaining credit for businesses especially if they are bringing up children on their own. If they remarry their children may not be cared for properly by stepfathers.
- 107. For **men** accessing sufficient land, livestock and labour and establishing their own household through marriage are major challenges in their lifecycle. Once established improving their livelihoods and bringing up children are constant concerns. Those facing death of their wife or divorce experience an immediate problem of obtaining female labour especially for cooking unless they have adult daughters or sisters, and most remarry. Loss of land due to divorce was a major problem for divorced men in Yetmen.
- 108. For the **elderly** loss of resources and health problems are major risks increasing with age, and particularly important for older women living alone. Relations with their children and support from them, neighbours and relatives are crucial for a good life in old age. In the drought prone sites interventions related to direct support through the PSNP and food aid have been vital for the survival of the poorest. Interventions in health care are the most important for the elderly, and many have benefited from the expansion of services closer to whether they live. Some benefited from trachoma medicine although others took the medicine without being aware what it was for.
- 109. Health differentials, interventions and exclusion risks. Differentials in access to curative health care was related largely to wealth; especially in the integrated sites richer households were able to afford private health care in urban centres. Wealthier households were also more disparaging about the quality of services available in the communities in the integrated sites whereas opinions seemed to be more uniform in the remoter drought prone sites, with preferences for private clinics often expressed. The costs of curative care were noted as constraints especially by poorer, elderly and female headed households in several sites. Traditional cures were often preferred for some illnesses especially among poorer households.
- 110. Health **cost exemptions** for poorer households were not known in most sites and in Turufe the system was found to have become bureaucratic, time consuming and had broken down in the context of the recently introduced heath care financing system.

- 111. Attitudes towards **preventive care** range from enthusiasm in Girar, through interest in Turufe and acceptance in Geblen and Korodegaga to resistance in Yetmen and especially Dinki. The cost of soap was mentioned as a constraint on washing practices in several sites, and latrine use was resisted especially in the Amhara sites.
- 112. Women heading households tended to have more positive experiences of health extension services partly due to the fact that the Health Extension Workers are women, who were appreciated in most sites with less enthusiasm in the Amhara sites. Women dependents had more involvement with health services than male dependents. Contraception was particularly important for the women whereas the male dependents expressed resistance to its use.
- 113. Health issues become more important with **old age**. Older women heading households in particular were appreciative of health services, and likewise elderly and dependent men had made use of health facilities and received assistance from HEWs. However, inability to afford health care was a concern for poorer elderly people, especially older women.
- 114. <u>Education differentials, interventions and exclusion risks.</u> Important issues relate to wealth and access, gender, and quality of education. Pre-school kindergartens exist in urban centres close to all three integrated sites, benefiting primarily richer households who can afford the cost. In one of the remoter sites the pre-school was said not to be effective as children learn with grade one and only those living close by attend. Satellite schools in another remote site provide younger children access to schooling which was not previously available.
- 115. There have been impressive changes in **primary school access** with a massive expansion, and noteworthy gains in **girls' primary education**, with more girls than boys at school in most sites. However, some children still do not go to school as their labour is needed for household survival. These are usually though not always from poor households and/or that have fallen off track due to death or divorce of parents; children from very poor households are sometimes sent to richer households to work as herders. However, there are also cases of children from wealthier households who drop out of school early. Children's **absence from school** is partly related to the need for child labour in peak agricultural seasons but also to household labour profiles.
- 116. Wealth become more important in relation to **secondary school** due to the costs associated with transport, accommodation and maintenance, and children from poorer households are more likely to drop out. Gender disparities are reversed with fewer girls going on to secondary school. TVET services are available in close proximity for students in three sites including two of the integrated sites, but there is a high demand and entrance is restricted.
- 117. Access to tertiary education is not entirely determined by wealth since government education is subsidised. There are a few students, mainly boys, including some from poorer households in all sites except Dinki who have been to universities, and some cases obtaining jobs subsequently. However, there are very few girls who have been to university. In the integrated sites some wealthier household were able to send sons and even daughters to private colleges in urban centres.
- 118. There are a number of cases of **graduates finding work** and assisting their families and sponsoring their siblings' education in the three integrated sites. However, a female teacher in Turufe said she knew of at least four youths who were **unemployed graduates** of private colleges.
- 119. There has been some educational **assistance from NGOs** in threes sites: However, only in one of the three did it seem to be directed at a poor household. There was little mention of involvement with Parent Teachers Associations, and school quality was rarely mentioned.
- 120. **Livelihoods**. In all the six sites agriculture is the mainstay of livelihoods. However, genderage, wealth and status, as well as site differences, the type of agriculture, other livelihoods, investment and market opportunities matter crucially in the extent to which interventions in agriculture have differential effects, and whether they can lead to exclusions.

- 121. **Agriculture**. Development of **irrigation** has increased household labour requirements which can involve child labour. In one case a girls group suggested that boys were not longer fetching water and collecting wood as they were involved in working in irrigated fields. However, income from irrigation and improved diets can benefit children and in one case use of income for clothing and education was mentioned.
- 122. The campaign to dig **water harvesting ponds** was resisted in some sites on the grounds that it could be dangerous for children and livestock who could fall in and drown, though the extent to which this was perceived as a real threat or as a justification for other reasons for disliking the campaign may be questioned.
- 123. The key issue with regard to **children's role in agriculture** is the tension between school and agricultural work, notably herding livestock. Richer households may employ a labourer, who may be a landless adult or a child of a poorer relative or from a very poor household which values the additional income. However, this transposes the problem from the rich to the poor and raises issues of **exclusion** of children in very poor households. Delaying the age at which children go to school can be a way of ensuring that the herding is done, children may drop out from school early, or one child may not be sent to school.
- 124. Changes in access to schools and education policy can affect the dynamics of child labour. The building of primary schools at *kebele* level and satellite schools at *got*, sub-community level, has meant less distance to school allowing children to work after school. Likewise, the construction of secondary schools in nearer towns enables children to come home at weekends to help families. However, attempts to move from **shift to full day** schooling were successfully resisted.
- 125. Interventions to address **youth landlessness** have sought to provide some land from communal areas to youth (largely male) organised into cooperatives, though these initiatives only materialised in a few sites, involved relatively small numbers and faced various problems (see Bevan 2011).
- 126. Interventions aimed at protecting **women's land rights** have enabled divorcees, widows, and daughters to make claims to land, and in practice some cases have been taken to wereda courts successfully. This may have exacerbated land shortage facing male youths, with daughters claiming rights to a share to the detriment of their brothers, and for older men as divorced wives claim a share of the land their husbands used. However, in practice given virilocal marriage patterns in which women tend to marry away from their natal village and since land rights are linked to residence this may be only a marginal factor contributing to the overall land shortage.
- 127. The **land registration and certification** has had important effects in relation to women's land rights. Wives were expected to be registered alongside husbands with their names and photographs on the certificates. Despite some opposition from men, especially in Dinki from Argobba men invoking Sharia law, this has enabled divorcees to claim land, sometimes taking cases to the wereda level, and has allowed women heading households to assert claims to land that sharecroppers tried to claim as theirs, notably in Turufe.
- 128. **Agricultural extension services** have focused not just on those with land but also those with sufficient capital and labour to afford to adopt technologies and inputs, including fertiliser, improved seeds and breeds, and, where there is irrigation potential, water pumps. The model farmers that the Development Agents work with are mainly rich and male. Women heading households tend to be overlooked since they generally have less land and need male labour for agriculture, but also because of biases undervaluing the involvement of women in agriculture.
- 129. The end to the provision of fertiliser on credit, increasing prices and risks of failure in the drought-prone sites have meant that women heading households are less keen and able to use **fertiliser** and **improved seeds**. The alternative of **compost** promoted in all sites has been adopted by some women. However, it requires adding manure, and female headed households tending to be poorer have less livestock to make this effective. The use of **manure** involves female and child labour

to carry the manure to fields. Younger boys in Dinki mentioned that this was difficult work and compost was used close to the homesteads.

- 130. Access **to credit for improved seeds** is limited by supply and in Dinki an older girls group suggested that there was discrimination and that female headed households and those not related to persons in power were excluded.
- 131. Regarding **livestock services** there is a **genderage difference** between ownership of cattle and small-stock, with packages for cattle, especially oxen and cross-bred cows being promoted mainly for richer male headed households whereas sheep, goats and especially hens are seen as also involving women and youth. The introduction of breed chickens that might have been useful for women failed in the drought prone sites. Poverty was also cited as a reason for women not making use of livestock services.
- 132. Interventions aimed at promoting **irrigation** were also more accessible for wealthy households who are generally male, especially insofar as groups need to be formed to purchase pumps. However, in Korodegaga some female headed household obtained irrigated land and others formed a women's agricultural cooperative. The irrigated nursery in Dinki provided wage labour which was appreciated by adolescent girls and young women, and in Yetmen working on irrigation is an emerging activity for women.
- 133. Promotion of **agricultural investment** had limited impact except for Korodegaga where investors have provided labour opportunities for youth, both men and women, as well as migrant labourers. The Australian investor also helped a women's cooperative by ploughing their land with his tractor only asking them to pay for fuel costs, and members of the youth cooperative obtained work loading his vegetables onto lorries; however, another youth cooperative had been given the land by the *kebele* which was subsequently allocated by the wereda to the investor, revealing power struggles with potential benefits in land allocation of for *kebele* and Wereda administrations.
- 134. Lack of **land redistribution** since the Derg, **land registration and certification**, as well as legalisation of renting and leasing has been a step towards the consolidation of a 'kulak' landed peasant elite and incipient class formation. Ways in which forms of inheritance and interventions will affect this in the next generation remain to be seen.
- 135. **Extension services** in agriculture tend to be directed at the wealthier households due primarily to their greater assets and capacity to afford inputs. Moreover, extension agents with limited time and resources focus on **model farmers** who are largely among the wealthy. The **landless** are much less likely to benefit from services although some who sharecrop use fertiliser and improved seeds.
- 136. **Fertiliser** used to be provided on credit with preferences for model farmers. However, subsidies and credit were stopped and increasing prices have become a serious constraint for poorer farmers. Some stated that they simply cannot afford to pay. The alternative of using **compost** has been promoted in all sites but requires adding **manure** to be effective, and this means poorer households cannot produce much as they tend to have few livestock.
- 137. Provision of **Improved seeds** on credit is limited by supply and is focused on model farmers, whereas poorer farmers are wary of investing in these, particularly in the drought prone sites, which high crop failures risks sometimes compounded by inadequate extension advice. Poorer farmers facing food crises may also consume the seed becoming indebted, and there were allegations in one site that those with connections got the types of seeds that were preferred, and those with outstanding debts were denied seeds.
- 138. The cost of **crossbred cattle** meant that only a few very rich farmers in Turufe could afford to buy them paying the price upfront, though they did very well from it given the significant urban demand for milk. However, there was a strong view expressed that people would like to have them on credit. **Veterinary services** are appreciated by all wealth categories; however, some of the poor are unable to afford the services.

- 139. **Credit** tends to be used for purchase of livestock, and some forms of credit are allocated specifically for livestock purchase. However, often the poor are not considered creditworthy; even though there may be official criteria that the poor should be targeted, these are sometimes circumvented. In Girar credit for purchasing smallstock was targeted at the poor by the Catholic Mission through the *iddirs*.
- 140. Other technologies often provided through packages, such as **drip irrigation** in drought prone sites in Geblen, or the **broad-bed maker** to enable two harvests in one season in Yetmen; **water pumps** in the irrigable sites tend also to focus on model farmers and the rich, and the poor may be either unable to afford them or rightly wary of indebtedness. Given the costs pumps only very rich farmers can afford them as in Geblen, or wealthier farmers need to form groups to buy them as in Dinki and Yetmen. Costs as well as land shortage were mentioned as reasons for resistance to building **water ponds** in Dinki.
- 141. Interventions to support **poor households** with agriculture were limited to targeting poor households mainly for livestock in three sites, two of which were sponsored by NGO. Fruit seedlings were provided to some poor households in Girar by the Catholic mission and seeds were also provided by the *wereda* to those affected by pests destroying crops in Turufe in 2010.
- 142. **Ethnicity and religion** for the most part do not have a direct influence on agriculture and related interventions, and their influence tends to be mediated by gender, wealth and politics. However, in two of the multiethnic sites there is a contrast between economic power and political power. In Turufe, well-established migrants have been able to assert their land claims through the land registration and certification process. In Dinki the land certification process involving wives being certified co-owners was initially resisted by Argobba men on religious grounds, since they claimed that Sharia law does not allow equal property rights to women.
- 143. **Education** has some role to play in involvement in agricultural interventions. Literacy can be a criterion for positions of responsibility such as the employed head of the seedlings nursery in Dinki, who was able to invest income from his salary in other productive activities. One reason given by a farmer in Dinki for not planting in rows was that he was unable to read the crop calendar.
- 144. Links to people with **political power** is often relevant to access to resources, particularly in the aid dependent sites, and there were allegations that access to agricultural packages and credit may be influenced by connections with those in power and that conversely those without such connections may not be able to benefit.
- 145. **Adult Dependents** within households were generally not able to benefit much from agricultural interventions which are targeted at the household level through the head of the household. Younger dependents generally did not have land, and older ones were often infirm. However, gender and wealth matter. There were cases of young wealthy men benefiting from some extension advice, and even some poorer young men were able to obtain veterinary services and credit. In contrast among the women dependents most were poor and some extremely poor and most had no involvement with agricultural extension services. However, there were exceptions of rich wives in Geblen who obtained loans for livestock and other livelihood options.
- 146. **Migrant** status was also a constraint on access to agricultural extension in several sites as many migrants are dependents and not registered as residents. The category of **divorced men** in Yetmen was particularly bitter about the loss of land to former wives as a result of measures to enforce women's land rights. However, for women age and other statuses mattered. Though some **divorcee women** had benefited, older women dependents were divorced before the new legislation came into effect.
- 147. Regarding **illnesses** and **disabilities** the only form of agricultural livelihood assistance mentioned was related to categories affected by HIV/AIDS. In Turufe an NGO provided sheep for People living with HIV/AIDS; in Dinki a goat breeding programme for AIDS orphans was mentioned by *wereda* officials but not by respondents in the site.

- 148. <u>Domestic and household reproductive work</u>. The fact that girls are now going to school was mentioned as resulting in more work for mothers. Promotion of **fuel saving stoves** was noted in the three drought prone sites, though there were different views on their usefulness. Introduction of **grinding mills** in the integrated sites in part as a result of introduction of electricity in Turufe and close access in Girar to the electric grinding mill in Imdibir has been seen as a labour reducing intervention, and sites closer to urban centres have better access to mill services.
- 149. Work in the community. The only case of interventions relating to customary work groups was an attempt in 2005 in Turufe to replace self-initiated group labour with labour groups organised by the local administrative structure, through the *gere*, the lowest level of organisation set up by the formal political system. This attempt at replacing customary labour organisation was apparently successfully resisted.
- 150. Though wage labour outside the communities due to agricultural investment is common there is limited wage labour resulting directly from interventions except for irrigation schemes especially in Korodegaga and to a lesser extent Dinki. Commercial farms in Korodegaga have been a source of additional income for locals including landless youth, women and poor persons and migrants. In Dinki poor and young women benefited from working on the seedlings nursery.
- 151. There are cooperatives based on age and gender in most sites. There were attempts to set up Youth Association cooperatives mainly composed of young men in all the sites although this failed in Dinki and Yetmen and only some were successful in Korodegaga. The one in Geblen was specifically for bee-keeping and women were offered to join but refused as bee-keeping was seen as a male activity. There are Women's Association cooperatives in three sites Girar, Yetmen (for spinning) and Korodegaga, (for irrigation). In all three sites the women's cooperatives obtained land but with a struggle, and faced opposition in Girar the cooperative provided credit to members, and played a role in social support for women facing domestic violence, for orphans, and in promoting HIV/AIDS tests for returning male migrants.
- 152. Working on community projects involves **free labour** on natural resources rehabilitation work, irrigation, or **food-for work** activities. The former is defined as a specified number of days a year. The food for work has been mainly related to the productive safety nets in the two PSNP sites. In Dinki the work involved environmental rehabilitation, road construction, and work on the seedlings nursery, which has been considered a useful source of income notably by some younger women.
- 153. <u>Non-farm local work</u>. There has been limited promotion of non-farm activities. Promotion of trading opportunities for youth groups in some sites was not successful. Despite campaigns against discrimination of craftworkers in Girar, women potters complained that agricultural extension workers were not interested in promoting their work. In Girar there was confusion over changes in the tax for traders as Imdibir gained a municipality status leading to resented higher taxes. Opportunities for work on the PSNP was said to have resulted in a reduction in collection of firewood as a coping strategy of the poor, especially elderly destitute women.
- 154. The Productive Safety Net and Food Aid. Though the PSNP regulations specifically exclude children from public works, some evidence suggest that there are cases of children working, and that parents working on public works results in children substituting work they would have done in the house, particularly affecting girls.
- 155. Food for malnourished children was shared among all family members, as well as more generally the PSNP rations among a larger number of households rather than following the guidelines of full family targeting of fewer households. This ethic is quite strongly expressed even by children. Fieldwork in 2007 revealed that wereda officials were well aware of this practice and although this was against policy, said it was important to have 'socially acceptable solutions'.
- 156. PSNP public works have encouraged women to work, and in Geblen female-headed households were specifically targeted. Involvement in the public works has been useful to women heading

households, preventing them from having to migrate to look for work which is difficult if they have small children and can be more risky for them.

- 157. The targeting of the PSNP direct support includes the elderly and the "weak". The assistance has clearly been very important for the survival of the poor, elderly without support and for women with children. However, some poor without relatives or friends in positions of authority were excluded and better off households with networks connecting them to officials were included. Poor people in Geblen were reportedly using some of the income to **pay debts** and there were cases using it as collateral for obtaining loans. Although the assistance is vital for the livelihood of the very poor, for better off households it may be useful as one element in their diversified livelihoods, as noted in Korodegaga, to prevent them from selling assets notably livestock as distress sales, or to avoid borrowing money to buy food thereby allowing them to overcome seasonal food shortage. In Dinki the food for work was most useful for the landless and those whose livelihoods are based on daily labour.
- 158. Among younger dependents in the aid-dependent sites both men and women dependents that were interviewed were working on food for work and receiving food aid. Elderly dependents whether male or female had benefited from PSNP **direct support**. In Turufe some migrant women as well as men had benefited from food aid after an epidemic and drought. Genderage, poverty and power interact such that **poor women** who are not well connected are **vulnerable to exclusion**.
- 159. There were suggestions in all the aid dependent sites that the food assistance could be harmful in instilling a culture of dependency and perverse incentives. An overall conclusion in Geblen was that the PSNP doesn't bring significant change in people's life, although it helps them sustain their livelihoods. A major issue seems to be that the package and credit programme accompanying the PSNP is failing most people.
- 160. Access to microfinance. Microfinance credit services vary considerably by site, involving credit from government and private MFIs, associations, cooperatives and NGOs. Many of the government MFIs and cooperatives credit schemes are directed more at men, and screening is often carried out by *kebele* officials who use as criteria of creditworthiness whether the person has land and assets which tend to exclude poorer women headed households and landless youth. Moreover, the group collateral model of lending which the MFIs use can lead to women being discriminated against, as men are likely to be less keen on forming groups with them. However, some women only groups are formed and there have been attempts by cooperatives and MFIs to promote women's borrowing for reasons of gender equity and since women are said to be less likely to misuse loans.
- 161. Potential negative effects on **children** if loans lead to indebtedness were mentioned. In Dinki a girls group expressed concerns that sale of key assets such as livestock to repay loans could lead to indebtedness, sale of further assets, including livestock and land, resulting in children dropping out of school, losing a home, sometimes ending in family break up, and the danger of becoming further indebted to repay loans..
- 162. The **elderly** were specifically excluded from getting package loans in Geblen, even though land was not a requirement. Forced taking of package fertiliser loans harmed poor people. One woman who was landless had to take the fertiliser under threat of not having access to PSNP support.
- 163. Some credit services directed specifically at women in three sites: Korodegaga, Girar and Turufe, and cases of women who benefited considerably. However, there were also cases of credit harming women, particular poor women. The group lending modality is also another factor discriminating against poorer farmers, as richer farmers are less likely to want to join them in forming a group.
- 164. There is some evidence of credit leading to **indebtedness** of poorer farmers, as a result of drought, loss of livestock to disease, or other shocks, which explain the reluctance expressed by many poorer farmers to take credit. Forced extension package credit of fertiliser under threat of

losing access to PSNP was a major reason why poorer people were bitter about and wary of package loans.

- 165. There were concerns about failed loans and poor people especially women facing cycles of indebtedness and suggestions in several sites that credit was not appropriate for the poor. In Dinki there was mention of people using loans for consumption and loosing land as a result of indebtedness, and loss of oxen bought with loans leading to serious family problems, especially affecting children who were facing hunger.
- 166. However, some categories of **women dependents**, notably wives and young women living with parents, have been able to benefit from interventions relating to livestock and certain categories of women have done well from credit in some sites, particularly wives in Girar and women with children in Geblen.
- 167. **Muslims** were less keen to take credit in Geblen, under influence of migrants from Arab countries, on the grounds that it was not allowed by Islam. One Muslim leader suggested it led to bad habits.
- 168. <u>Migration</u>. Commercial agriculture, notably flower farms in the Rift Valley and urban development have been major indirect factors resulting in migration of young men and women, some of whom have been able to save and send remittances to their families.
- 169. Forced migration of girls to work as housemaids in towns, often organised by their relatives, was a particular problem in Girar and was an issue taken up by the wereda women's affairs and NGOs in campaigns, allegedly leading to a decline in the practice.
- 170. Migration to towns and abroad has tended to be **viewed negatively by government**. The only interventions relating to this were the discouraging of trafficking of girls from Girar and the change of package credit from cash to kind in Geblen. There was also an attempt in Turufe to prevent migrants from other regions working in the area. Indirectly, however, the productive safetynet programme has been seen as a way of avoiding distress migration due to food insecurity and shocks particularly of women, and in many ways it seems likely that this has had the effect of discouraging migration which would have otherwise taken place. It is also possible that the promotion of women's land rights and measures countering violence against women may have avoided some female distress migration.
- 171. Many interventions in various sectors have indirectly **encouraged migration**, including road construction and improved transport facilities, availability and development of better health and education facilities in towns, education of youth whose ambitions are broadened and who aspire to jobs and urban lifestyles, increase in wealth of some farmers leading them to being able to send children to higher education in towns, build houses in local towns, and make use of better urban health facilities, the expansion of towns creating opportunities for labour in construction and informal sector activities, and the expansion of agricultural development notably private investment offering attractive wage labour opportunities.
- 172. **Social Re/pro/duction.** Interventions in this field are limited and relate to campaigns to assert women's land rights on divorce were having some effect, though women often do not press land claims but return to their parental villages. Where they do press claims this can result in tensions. In Yetmen divorced men were complaining that they no longer had viable plots after sharing with their wives
- 173. **Cultural ideas.** There have been limited interactions relating to cultural ideas. Most of these are associated largely with traditions defined as harmful. Campaigns to prevent child marriages have been most prominent in Amhara Region notably in Yetmen and were said to have had some success. Attempts to discourage polygamy and widow inheritance were mentioned in the Oromia sites and these practices seem to be on the decline. Inherited wives have been able to claim land rights for their children and themselves and become more independent, sometimes with wereda support.

- 174. Other areas relate to customs of celebrating saints' days which the modern and state cultural repertoires opposed but were upheld by Christian leaders.
- 175. **Customary community governance.** There have been attempts by Wereda and *kebele* administrations to interact with customary institutions, notably elders in Oromia sites in the campaigns against traditions defined as harmful, particularly relating to female circumcision, polygyny and widow inheritance.
- 176. More generally officials have attempted to worth through funeral associations. Local authorities have sought to involve *iddirs* in development activities, especially in providing contributions and mobilising members. There have been both collaborative and oppositional mobilisations. The former can involve labour, cash, and awareness raising campaigns. *Iddirs* were also used in conflict resolution and imposing fines, and have provided their rules to *kebeles* and people can be taken to the *kebele* court if they fail to abide by the *iddir* rules. In Girar the HEWs and the *kebele* officials gave training on contraceptives and women issues, and the Catholic mission provided animals in credit through *iddirs*, and UNICEF training to *iddir* members. However, *iddirs* have also been involved in oppositional mobilisation in two sites, against the construction of a school on grazing land in Yetmen and in opposing the move of Shashemene hospital further away from Turufe.

V. Towards an improved Differentials-Exclusion framework

- 177. Much of the lack of awareness about differential impacts of interventions stems from limited appreciation of how differences in types of communities, households and persons affect the ways in which services are accessed and who benefits, and how different forms of exclusion affect various categories of household and persons.
- 178. This requires thinking through implications of given interventions at the four levels, in relation to the four factors underlying inequalities and the four dimensions of exclusions. The framework should consider how the four levels, the four factors of inequality and the four dimensions of exclusion are interrelated.
- 179. The framework would thus need to understand the four levels: 1) inter-community, 2) intracommunity, 3) inter-household and 4) intra-household, and how these are interconnected. It would need to take account of the four major factors underlying inequalities: 1) location, 2) gender-age, 3) wealth and poverty, 4) other statuses, and how these are inter-related. It should focus on the four dimensions of exclusion: 1) economic, 2) social, 3) cultural and 4) political, and how these are intertwined.
- 180. **Inter-community differences** were related to ten parameters.
 - 1) Regional variations in policies and implementation
 - 2) Urban linkages of various kinds
 - 3) Development services
 - 4) Core livelihood system
 - 5) Diversification
 - 6) New agricultural technologies
 - 7) Cultural differences
 - 8) Social inequality
 - 9) Social integration
 - 10) Government-society relations
- 181. These were regrouped into three broad areas:
 - 1) Government-community relations
 - 2) Livelihoods and urban linkages
 - 3) Socio-cultural context

- 182. Three key factors differentiate communities in relation to these areas:
 - 1) Economic and political (in)dependence
 - 2) Urban proximity and service integration
 - 3) Internal community composition
- 183. The emergent typology differentiates into broad categories for each of the three factors
 - 1) Dependent versus independent economies
 - 2) Remote versus integrated sites
 - 3) Homogeneous versus heterogeneous communities
- 184. Intra-community differences were related to the following four factors
 - 1) Geographical location, settlement and topography
 - 2) Access to roads and communications
 - 3) Access to water and irrigation
 - 4) Access to administration and services
- 185. Inter-household differences were related to the following six factors
 - 1) Access to resources
 - 2) Labour composition
 - 3) Position on the development cycle
 - 4) Types of household
 - 5) Shocks faced
 - 6) Household status
- 186. Intra-household differences between individuals were related to two main factors
 - Genderage
 - 2) Dependent status
- 187. **Exclusions** were seen as having the following four dimensions.
 - 1) Economic exclusion
 - 2) Social exclusion
 - 3) Cultural exclusion
 - 4) Political exclusion
- 188. Households vulnerable to exclusion include the following eight categories:
 - The destitute and extremely poor
 - 2) Very poor female-headed households,
 - 3) Elderly households without support
 - 4) Marginalised craftworkers
 - 5) Marginalised migrants groups
 - 6) Households in early and late stages of the development cycle
 - 7) Households that have fallen off the ideal cycle
 - 8) Households facing shocks, notably health and social shocks
- 189. **Individuals** vulnerable to exclusion include the following twelve categories:
 - 1) Children of very poor households or of servants or migrants
 - 2) Boys not going to school
 - 3) Adolescent boys and young men from poor, migrant or disadvantaged families

- 4) Adolescent girls and young women from poor and disadvantages categories
- 5) Very poor and destitute adults,
- 6) Adult migrants without access to resources
- 7) Adults facing health shocks, including accidents, chronic illness and disabilities
- 8) Adult household dependents, servants and labourers
- 9) Widows and divorcees (and to a lesser extent widowers and divorced men)
- 10) The elderly who do not have support and lack resources or face disabilities
- 11) Elderly women living on their own, especially from minorities or low status groups
- 12) Persons with illnesses associated with social stigma (HIV/AIDS, leprosy, mental illness)

VI. Policy and Practice Implications

- **190.** A better understanding of the levels of inequalities, the factors underlying them and dimensions of exclusion and the categories of community, household and individuals most at risk can inform improvements to policy and practice. Approaches of government and donors have tended to focus on federal policies and the impact of programmes sectorally at regional and wereda level, or on measures relating to broad categories of person. However, **the impact of interventions on different types of communities, household and individuals within them deserves more consideration**.
- **191.** Focusing on community differences and types. Ten parameters explained differences between communities in three broad areas: 1) Government-community relations, Livelihoods and urban linkages, and 3) Socio-cultural context. Whereas more attention is given to government-community relations, livelihoods, urban linkages and socio-cultural contexts are very much interrelated with governance.
- 192. In terms of the typology of communities, the independent economies and the integrated periurban sites have changed rapidly. Opportunities to control surplus through trade led to the emergence of elites and rising inequalities, although urban linkages are also important for poorer households. However, much of the growth and change has not been directly related to the focus of the agricultural extension services. Social protection support in these communities was more limited and most of the care for vulnerable categories is left to community institutions. *Drivers of change promoting growth in peri-urban communities and greater linkages between extension services and market potential could be important. Simultaneously enhancing community social protection and mitigating exclusion risks deserves consideration.*
- 193. In the dependent economies food for work and safetynet direct support has supported livelihoods notably of the very poor and vulnerable categories. However, some wealthier households were included, due in part to a community ethic of sharing, and some poorer, female-headed and less well connected households were excluded. Provision of food assistance has also resulted in greater control and there was less change related to local initiative and enterprise. In dependent communities with irrigation there has been more potential for cash-crop production and opportunities for those with access to improve livelihoods. However, access to irrigation has been limited and controlled by older generations, local elites and investors. *Promoting community inclusion of categories currently excluded from assistance, enhancing enterprise beyond food assistance and increasing more inclusive access to irrigation deserve greater attention*.
- **194.** Not all heterogeneous sites had cultural differences which were related to marked inequalities. However, some correlations between identities, control over resources and local power relations was a feature of all communities and this was more salient in the heterogeneous societies. Migration histories and the politics of resource control are particularly important in multi-cultural

settings. In some contexts cultural differences are interrelated with genderage as well as wealth; other distinctions between sites relate to the existence of other marginalised categories such as craftworkers and migrants and the extent to which these are marginalised and excluded.

Communities where social inequality is high and social integration is low are potential places where conflict may erupt in conditions of instability; ways of mitigating tensions, promoting integration and addressing the needs of marginalised categories deserve consideration.

- 195. In terms of differences within communities proximity to urban areas, to developing *Kebele* centres and villagised areas of sites provides better opportunities to access services and infrastructure. However, poverty and gender may interact with location in excluding categories from access to administration and services. *An awareness of differences based on location and how access to infrastructure and services is unequally distributed within sites can inform policies and programme to promote greater spread and equity in access and service use. Exclusions relating to location, poverty and gender deserve greater attention.*
- **196.** Focusing on household resources, cycles and types. Inequalities between households were found to depend primarily on the following six factors: 1) access to resources, 2) labour composition 3) position on the development cycles, 4) household types, 5) shocks faced, and 6) the household's status.
- household heads who have fallen off the ideal household cycle due to divorce and death of their spouse, and youth who have not been able to establish themselves and get onto the ideal cycle due to parental control of limited resources and limited alternatives. Female headed households had less land, livestock and assets. However, among female-headed household divorcees tended to be less well off than widows though cultural differences affect their respective statuses. Promotion of women's land rights has improved the prospects of divorcees, widows, and inherited wives; however, upon divorce women may assert land rights and face constraints of access to male labour. Though women's land rights have improved largely as a result of interventions, more attention to their access to livestock and income-generating activities could help to improve their status. Not all women heading households are poor or marginalised and culturally mediated distinctions between widows and divorcees are relevant. Access of young men and women to resources and livelihoods is discussed in the companion paper (Bevan 2011).
- 198. Household labour composition is related to the development cycles and households in the early and late phases face labour shortage. Though adoption traditions differ richer households facing labour shortages generally bring in children often of poorer relatives, and/or agricultural and domestic labourers. Children from poorer households working in richer households often face hardships, lack of care and education and potential abuse. Agricultural labourers and domestic servants often complain of unfair treatment. They tend to form an invisible underclass of underprivileged and exploited rural workers, not managing to escape this status which may be inherited. Disputes with migrant labourers who were not paid, and more generally between migrants and residents were common. Women working as domestic servants are particularly at risk of exploitation and abuse including rape. In the Gurage site traditions of sending children sent to work as labourers to urban areas were viewed as "trafficking" and interventions to counter this practice were said to have been fairly successful. Though trafficking of children to urban areas has been the subject of campaigns, abuse of children working as domestic labourers has not been the subject of interventions. Household labourers form an invisible exploited underclass, and female domestic labourers are further at risk of sexual abuse. Migrant domestic workers may not be able to obtain services and lack recourse in conflicts with employers. Advocacy regarding rights of these genderage categories of rural excluded minorities would be important for social change.

- 199. Household development cycles are mediated by cultural traditions resulting in two basic household types: those that follow the ideal cycle and those that deviate by not entering the cycle, falling off it due to death of divorce or abandonment, or are in decline. There is a strong probability of households that have fallen off cycles being short of labour and among the poorer or destitute. Widows and divorcees face particular problems related to access to male labour, land and in bringing up children. Men are more likely to remarry after becoming widowers or divorcing. Understanding household cycles and types can lead to a better appreciation of the dynamics of household poverty and how inequalities change over time and generations. The constraints faced by "off-cycle deviator" types, especially widow(er)s, divorcees and elderly households are insights with potentially important policy implications.
- 200. Household shocks were categorised into four types: 1) livelihood and reproductive asset shocks, 2) human resources health shocks, 3) social shocks that are household related, and 4) social shocks that are government related. Often multiple shocks combine leading to downward spirals of impoverishment leading to destitution. Poorer and destitute households report a greater proportion of human resource health shocks. Fire, loss of jobs and debt, divorce and theft and disputes were more commonly reported among the extremely poor. Wealthier households are better able to withstand shocks notably drought, whereas poorer and elderly households are more vulnerable and resort to wage labour and seasonal migration to cope. Loss of livestock especially oxen can force households to give land to sharecroppers leading to impoverishment. Costs of illness can lead to indebtedness and even to the possibility of exclusion from institutions. Deaths often follow high expenses for illness treatment and involve high costs for funerals, borne partly by burial associations explaining willingness of even poor households to invest in regular *iddir* payments. A better understanding of types of shocks and how they are related to household cycles, poverty and genderage can inform social protection policies and programmes.
- 201. Household status tends to be associated with the household head. The gender and age of the household head are inter-related with wealth, partly mediated by cultural patterns. Powerful older men often from dominant status groups have better access to resources and can mobilise support networks; women, younger and poor men have less access to resources and little say in community affairs. Other statuses relate to 1) ethnicity and religion, 3) clan identities, 3) residence status, and 4) occupational "caste. Ethnicity is important in power relations in two of the three heterogeneous sites and is interrelated with migration histories, wealth and politics. Religious identities were important in relation to education and women's rights. Clanship is important among the Arssi Oromo though its significance has declined, apart for in cases of murder and bridewealth payments. Recent in-migrants may not have rights of access to resources and services, except where they have been long established, and may face discrimination. Craftworker minorities used to be marginalised; despite changes though prejudices remain. A better understanding of cultural statuses and ways in which minority groups may continue to be marginalised and excluded can inform policy and programmes seeking to promote changes in rural poverty.
- **202.** Focusing on intrahousehold genderage and dependence. Gender and age are inextricably linked and the fundamental aspects of intra-household power relations and inequalities. Genderage is often interlinked with wealth and other statuses over the individual's life cycle.
- **203.** Many of the problems facing **infants** relate to the circumstances of their mothers, with poverty, marital status, and occupation of women having a bearing on their childrearing. **Children** particularly in poorer household may have to work from an early age. Though some child work is necessary for household survival and much of it may not be detrimental, excessive work may be harmful particularly for children of poorer and female headed households, sometimes sent to work in richer households. Though most children go to school exceptions, include wealthier households requiring child labour for herding. More boys than girls are attending primary school with the gender

balance reversed in secondary school reflecting gender biases and expectations. Attempts to stop the shift school system were successfully resisted in Turufe revealing community that full day education is unpopular. A focus on maternal reproductive health can be important for improving conditions for infants. Measures to avoid excessive child labour and discourage employment of child servants may be useful; however banning child labour may not be advisable given rural household labour needs, and shift schooling and flexible calendars may be more effective. Gender disparities with more boys than girls not in school at primarily level and more girls not continuing to secondary and post secondary levels have important policy and programme implications.

- **204.** Condition of the **youth** and the dilemmas, opportunities and constraints they face are the subject of the companion paper (Bevan 2011). Gender differences become accentuated among **adolescents** and with potential sexual activity the differences become most salient with greatly increased risks for girls and young women of abduction, rape, forced marriage, and not finding a husband. **Inequalities between the youth** depend in part on parental ability and willingness to endow children which is also mediated by cultural traditions. **A focus on adolescents and particularly girls can be an important strategy for interventions to affect intergenerational poverty transmission.**
- **205.** Differences between **adults** depend largely on gender, the status of the household, and whether the adult is a household head, spouse or other dependent. Within households **dependents** have limited say in decision-making and restricted access to resources and services. The status of dependents is related to genderage, wealth and other household statuses. **A greater awareness of the differential conditions of adult dependents could highlight needs of this neglected category.**
- 206. In old age the main risk is lack of support and losing control of resources to guarantee that support, once the effects of ageing become felt; wealth and gender differences are crucial in old age, since wealthier elderly households may retain filial allegiance and/or employ household labour, whereas poorer household without support rely on neighbours, community or religious charity. Poorer old women living on their own may be involved in low status activities. Health concerns become more prominent with old age, and improvements in the health extension services and direct support through the productive safety net were welcomed by the elderly, though they may be excluded from certain development initiatives. More policy and programme emphasis on the needs of the elderly, particularly older women living on their own is desirable; enhancing community social protection and health care for the elderly are potential areas for advocacy and interventions.
- **207.** A focus on exclusions. Whereas the literature has focused mainly on social the four dimensions of exclusion (economic, social, cultural and political) are interrelated. Exclusions affect categories of person with specific statuses, notably household servants, adult dependents, migrants and craftworkers though statuses are often mediated by genderage and wealth.
- **208.** <u>Economic exclusion</u> is related to inequalities and tends to be a manifestation of forms of unequal distribution of resources mediated by genderage dimensions. The focus of agricultural and credit extension on richer male households may exclude de facto the poor, women, youth and elderly. Extreme forms of economic exclusion lead to **class-like inequalities**. Two categories often particularly at risk are **household labourers** and **migrants**. *Advocacy to promote more focus of extension services on appropriate measures for non-agricultural extension and addressing the needs and capabilities of specific vulnerable categories could be useful; exclusion of marginalised categories notably labourers and migrants deserves attention.*
- **209.** <u>Social exclusion</u> relates to the social status of categories of person and is often linked to the economic inequalities. Genderage often channels and restricts access to resources. Youth, women heading households, the elderly and dependents tend to have less access to land and other

resources. Exclusion from forms of social organisation, networks and associations is partly related economic exclusion, due to inability of the poor to afford membership fees, or the cost of sponsoring work parties. Despite some social inclusion and protection of the destitute and people with illnesses and disabilities, people with illnesses linked to social stigma, such as HIV/AIDS, leprosy and mental illness, may be ostracised. Affirmative action to counter social exclusion may face resistance or heighten tensions as with the case of women's land rights. *Interventions focusing on social categories at risk of exclusion including the poor, female headed, elderly and dependents, and people with stigmatised illnesses deserve support.*

- **210.** <u>Cultural exclusion</u> is linked to identity markers and norms related to ethnicity and/or religion and cultural traditions, sometimes linked to gender and local politics. Affirmative action to counter cultural exclusion may face resistance or heighten tensions as noted in relations to customs defined as harmful such as female genital cutting, early marriage, polygyny and widow inheritance. *Attempts to change customary practices may be more effective through mediation and negotiating with cultural brokers rather than simply through imposed legislation and penalties.*
- **211.** <u>Political exclusion</u> involved categories who were seen to have been over-privileged in previous regimes, and cases of persons seen as linked to opposition. Indirect political exclusion involved persons without connections to people in authority some of whom were excluded from benefits notably in the safetynets. *Ways of enhancing mechanisms to include persons who have been excluded from services and social protection should be advocated.*
- 212. Exclusions are often linked to household characteristics and statuses. The following eight categories of household that are vulnerable to exclusion deserve particular attention: 1) The destitute and extremely poor, 2) very poor female-headed households, 3) elderly households without support, 4) marginalised craftworkers, 5) migrants, 6) Households in early and late stages of the development cycle, 7) households that have fallen off the ideal cycle, 8) households facing shocks notably health and social shocks.
- 213. Exclusions are also related to individual genderage in relation to wealth and other status characteristics. The following twelve categories of person may be considered to be particularly at risk: 1) children of very poor households and servants, 2) children not going to school (notably boys in primary and girls in secondary), 3) Adolescent boys and young men from poor, migrant or disadvantaged families, 4) Adolescent girls and young women from poor and disadvantages categories, 5) Very poor and destitute adults, 6) Adult migrants without access to resources, 7) Adults facing health shocks, including accidents, chronic illness and disabilities, 8) Adult household dependents, servants and labourers, 9) Widows and divorcees (and to a lesser extent widowers and divorced men, 10) The elderly who do not have support and lack resources or face disabilities, 11) Elderly women living on their own, especially from minorities or low status groups, and 12) Persons with illnesses associated with social stigma (HIV/AIDS, leprosy, mental illness).