Tracking Ethiopian rural communities since 1994: Select insights from EthiopiaWIDE

Pip Bevan, Catherine Dom, Alula Pankhurst, Sarah Vaughan
working through Mokoro Ltd

www.ethiopiawide.net

Mokoro Seminar at Meeting House, Oxford, 1 November 2016
Outline of talk

• The evolution of Ethiopia’s rural communities since 1991
• The WIDE longitudinal, qualitative, case-based study of twenty exemplar rural communities 1994-2013
• Our most recent analyses
• Part I – Changes in the communities as places, as differentiated societies, and for young people
• Part II – Changes in livelihood opportunities; changes in maternal and infant wellbeing
• Selected conclusions
Introduction

Changes affecting Ethiopia’s rural communities
The WIDE research
The communities and people
Changes affecting Ethiopia’s rural communities 1991-2016

• By 2014 estimated population = 99 million; an estimated 25,000 rural kebeles

• 1991: military/socialist regime in power from 1974 overthrown by rebel factions led by Tigrayans

• From 1991: revolutionary democracy then developmental state

• 1995: multinational federalism

• 2002 start of wereda/district-level decentralisation

• From 2002 Ethiopia entered a period of rapid modernisation
  – 2002-5 The first donor-supported ‘poverty reduction strategy paper’ - SDPRP
  – 2005-15 PASDEP; GTP
  – 2015-20 Growth and Transformation Plan II
Changes affecting Ethiopia’s rural communities 2003-13

Major modernisation processes

• Population growth; increasing life expectancies; healthier, better-fed, more educated and aspiring people...

• Increasing connectivity and relations with the outside world: urbanisation, roads, mobile phones, radio, (satellite) TV, urban and international migration and linkages..

• Increasing influx of ideas from outside: developmental, religious, political..

• Economic growth, diversifying economies, increasing average wealth and incomes, increasing economic inequality as rich get richer...

• Improvements for women, longer youth transitions to adulthood, child-rearing changes...

• Government development interventions increasingly penetrating rural communities in all domains, interacting with broader forces and local dynamics
Accelerating development

• Under-five mortality halved between 2000 and 2011
• Largest safety net programme in Africa to address chronic food insecurity (2005 – to date)

Figure 1. Ethiopia: GDP per capita
(in constant 2010 birr)

Figure 2. Ethiopia: Poverty Headcount Ratio at US$1.25 a day (PPP)
(in percent of population)

Source: IMF Staff Estimates.

Source: World Development Indicators, WB.
WIDE3 researcher workshop

Nursery manager interview

The WIDE research

Field worker

Visiting a coffee processing plant
What is WIDE?

Rigorous *longitudinal case-oriented* research aimed to be relevant to policy-makers and practitioners in Ethiopia

1995 WIDE1; 2003 WIDE2; 2010-13 WIDE3

In context of rapid macro-level change esp. since 2003

? What was the *cumulative impact* at micro level

? How did GOE *policies/programmes interact* with
  o local dynamics
  o wider modernisation processes
    ...to produce *transformation* and *continuity*

? In the different kinds of WIDE *communities*...

? ...and for different *kinds of people* living in them
The WIDE communities by Region and Zone

Amhara sites

Oromia sites

SNNP sites

Tigray sites
Different kinds of rural communities
Diverse rural livelihood systems

Drought-prone agriculture site

Coffee-producing site

Pastoralist site

Cash-crop site
Diverse rural livelihood systems

VULNERABLE COMMUNITIES
- Vulnerable cereal +
- Vulnerable livestock +
- Vulnerable enset +

SELF-SUFFICIENT COMMUNITIES
- Self-sufficient enset +
- Self-sufficient livestock +
- Self-sufficient grain +
Diverse locations in relation to towns and cities

- Shumsheha: bordered larger town - Lalibela
- Geblen: no town border
- Harresaw: no town border
- Yetmen: surrounded municipality
- Oda Haro: bordered municipality
- Girar: surrounded municipality
- Somodo: bordered city - Jimma
- Aze Debo'a: bordered larger town - Durame
- Gara Godo: surrounded municipality
- Luqa: no town border
- Do'oma: bordered larger town - Wacha
- Adado: no town border
- Turufe: bordered city - Shashemene
- Kormargefia: bordered city - Debre Berhan
- Dinki: no town border
- Adele Keke: bordered larger town
- Gelcha: bordered larger town
- Sirba: near city - Bishoftu
- Korodegaga: no town border
- Oda Dawata: surrounded municipality
- No town border

Legend:
- No town border
- Surrounded or bordered a municipality
- Bordered a larger town
- Bordered or near to a city
Diverse cultures and religions

- **Shumsheha**: Amhara
  - Orthodox 97%
- **Geblen**: Tigraway; Irob
  - Orthodox, Muslim, Catholic
- **Harresaw**: Tigraway
  - Orthodox
- **Kormargefia**: Amhara; Oromo
  - 5%; Orthodox
- **Yetmen**: Amhara
  - Orthodox
- **Oda Haro**: Oromo
  - Protestant 65%; Orthodox 25%, Muslim 10%
- **Girar**: Gurate
  - Orthodox, Catholic, Protestant, Muslim
- **Somodo**: Oromo
  - Yemen 15%; Muslim, Orthodox, Protestant
- **Aze Debo'a**: Kambata
  - Protestant
- **Gara Godo**: Wolayta
  - Protestant 66% + Orthodox 32%
- **Luqa**: Tsamay; Traditional 85%, Protestant 14%
- **Do'oma**: Gamo
  - 75% Wolayta 15%; Protestant 90%, Orthodox 10%
- **Adado**: Gedo
  - Protestant
- **Turufe**: Oromo, Amhara, Tigraway; Wolayta, Kambata
  - Muslim; Orthodox; Protestant
- **Dinki**: Argoba 60%, Amhara
  - Muslim 60%, Orthodox
- **Gelcha**: Karrayu 85%, Somali
  - 13%; Oromo; Muslim (95%)
- **Adele Keke**: Oromo
  - Muslim
- **Sirba**: Oromo, Amhara, Tigraway, Kambata Wolayta
  - Orthodox, Protestant, Muslim
- **Korodegaga**: Oromo
  - Muslim
- **Oda Dawata**: Oromo 70%; Amhara 25%; Muslim, few Orthodox

**Religious Definitions**
- **Orthodox**
- **Muslim**
- **Protestant**
- **Traditional**
- **Mixed**
Different kinds of people living in the communities
Our most recent analyses

Nine topic-specific discussion briefs
Nine book chapters in the making
WIDE Briefs Series II (2016)

- Introducing Ethiopia WIDE and its policy relevance
- Rurbanisation, urban expansion into rural areas, and thickening rural-urban linkages
- Differentiation and inequalities in rural communities
- Youth transitions to adulthood in rural communities
- Education in rural Ethiopia 2010-13: aspiration and uncertainty
- Changing patterns in maternal and infant health and wellbeing in rural Ethiopia from 2003-2013
- Economic participation of girls and women in rural Ethiopia, 2010-13
- Moving for work from rural communities, 2010-2013
- Insights on economic success in rural Ethiopia, 2010-2013
- Diffusion of knowledge, learning, “technology transfer” and change in rural communities
Changes in the communities as places, as differentiated societies, and for young people.
Urbanisation and the WIDE communities 2010-13
Urbanisation processes

• In 2010-13 the twenty WIDE communities were differentially caught up in three kinds of accelerating urbanising processes:
  – rurbanisation within rural kebeles: around kebele centres and along roads;
  – urban expansion into rural kebeles from outside;
  – thickening rural-urban linkages.

• Government, rural residents and private entrepreneurs were all involved in the development of these new urban spaces.

• These changing rural-urban dynamics were contributing to changes inside rural communities
  – agricultural modernisation, industrialisation, servicisation, and consumerisation
  – changes in community cultures and social relations
  – changes in people’s lifestyles, aspirations and well-being.
Patterns of urbanisation in the WIDE communities

- **Internal rurbanisation** much more advanced in some communities than others

- **Pressure from urban expansion** on the land of 12 of the 14 communities bordering towns; in most places those not living near the borders were unaffected

- The density and reach of **rural-urban links** to different kinds of towns (municipalities, larger towns, cities) varied considerably among the communities

- Different kinds of **urban aspirations and experiences** for different kinds of people: male/female; elderly, adults, youth, children; rich..poor

- **Biggest barriers** to accessing the benefits of urbanisation: **remoteness** and **poverty**
  - People in remote communities and poor communities had less access
  - People in remote households and poor households had less access
Rurbanisation
Rurbanisation: public infrastructures and ‘urban’ buildings

- By 2010-13 rurbanisation had made all the WIDE communities considerably less ‘rural’ than they were in 2003

- There were **differences among the communities** in internal road access, the quality of kebele buildings, the extent to which kebele centres had urbanised, access to electricity and mobile phones, and drinking water and irrigation infrastructure.

- **Fourteen** of the WIDE communities, eight of them drought-prone, had **irrigation structures and/or technologies** which had contributed to local economic growth

- All internal roads in the twenty communities were **dry-season only** and eleven had few or poorly constructed roads affecting access even in dry seasons.

- The **leading contributors** of cash, materials and labour for the construction and maintenance of internal roads, irrigation and safe drinking water infrastructure, and ‘urban’ buildings **were the local community**

- The quality of internal roads, irrigation structures and schools was notably **higher** in the few cases where the **wereda and/or NGOs had contributed** materials, cash and technical advice
Expansion of towns into rural areas
Diverse locations in relation to towns and cities

- Shumsheha: bordered larger town - Lalibela
- Geblen: no town border
- Harresaw: no town border
- Kormargefia: bordered city - Debre Berhan
- Dinki: no town border
- Adele Keke: bordered larger town
- Gelcha: bordered larger town
- Sirba: near city - Bishoftu
- Korodegaga: no town border
- Oda Dawata: surrounded municipality
- Kormargefia: bordered city - Debre Berhan
- Oda Haro: bordered municipality
- Yetmen: surrounded municipality
- Girar: surrounded municipality
- Somodo: bordered city - Jimma
- Aze Debo'a: bordered larger town - Durame
- Gara Godo: surrounded municipality
- Luqa: no town border
- Do'oma: bordered larger town - Wacha
- Adado: no town border
- Turufe: bordered city - Shashemene

- No town border 6
- Surrounded or bordered a municipality 5
- Bordered a larger town 5
- Bordered or near to a city 4
Expansion of towns into rural land

- Actual or planned urban expansion into rural land in many of the WIDE communities was **re-figuring rural landscapes**
- Four communities had **expanding internal kebele towns** and six were experiencing **ribbon development** along main roads
- Land had been taken, earmarked or requested by **6 municipalities, 3 larger towns and 3 cities**
- This expansion process was **disruptive** and brought **benefits to some and costs to others**; a number of particular issues were raised:
  - Top-down plans from two sectors for the same large piece of community land were causing uncertainty in two communities, illustrating the need for **co-operation among ministries**.
  - **Loss of agricultural and grazing land** was a concern.
  - The **pricing of urbanising land** near centres, roads, and urban borders, was obscure.
  - Following 10-year plan announcements there was **uncertainty** about (1) when the land would be taken and (2) compensation.
  - There were a few **conflicts** between rural and urban dwellers over land and water.
Thickening rural-urban linkages
• **Rural exports** of crops, livestock and products, and building materials supported **consumption in towns and cities** and provided rural inhabitants with **incomes and non-farm trading and transport opportunities**

• Richer rural families **invested in urban** houses and sometimes businesses

• In WIDE communities near towns with medium and large enterprises wealthier more educated young people **commuted** for work or **migrated**, sometimes combining work and education.

• **Different kinds of people** had different kinds of urban connection, e.g.:
  
  – **Young people** - leisure activities, secondary and college education, commuting in some places, migration for temporary or longer-term work at various skill levels;
  
  – **Richer** farmers, traders, and business people- obtaining urban land and building houses locally; links with city traders in some communities
  
  – Farmers, business people, and consumers **buying modern goods and services**
  
  – Sick people using health **services**; richer people using private health and education services
  
  – **Poor people** migrating for work as a last resort often facing a new set of poverty-related problems
Two important policy issues

UN(DER)EMPLOYED YOUTH

- Increase in non-farm business and employment opportunities in urbanising centres (4 communities), ribbon developments (6), and to varying degrees in nearby towns.

- But these communities were annually producing many more post-education young people than there were local opportunities for work.

REMITENESS

- Many remote rural communities have little internal urbanisation, are problematic distances from the nearest town, and far from important urban markets and higher-level health and education services.

- Many better-connected communities contain remote areas.

- Investment in utilities and services in towns and urbanising kebele centres does not help those being left behind due to remoteness.

- Modern technologies, including non-grid electricity, might be used to power out-reach programmes connecting remote rural people to some of the benefits of urbanisation.
Differentiation and inequalities in rural communities
Inequalities and differentiation between and within communities

- Prevailing perceptions of inequality as being mainly urban. Yet...
- Alongside growth and transformation, increasing differentiation between rural communities, and within them.

- **Community** level - Agricultural potential, irrigation and cash crops, infrastructure development, proximity to towns and generally greater integration with market.

- **Household and individual** levels - based mainly on combinations of gender, age, wealth and status.

- At the two ends: wealthiest households forming elite; destitute barely survived from charity and food aid.

- Greater changes in sites with more agricultural potential, cash crops, irrigation, diversified economies, and proximity to towns, leading to bigger gaps between the rich and poor.
Evolving relations between the rich and the poor

• Relations between the rich and the poor – from employment, share-cropping, share-rearing, credit and loans, to charity.

• With mutual benefit but greater advantages for the rich.

• Evidence in some communities of declining cooperation (drought, inflation, richer focusing on own production, shift from group or reciprocal work to hiring labour, greater internal divisions within a few communities).

• Nascent class relationships: farmers, and traders/businesspeople; big farmers accumulating land, and landless daily labourers.

• Categories of people who without special attention and tailored support could (continue to) ‘fall behind’: poor with labour, women, youth, vulnerable groups (e.g. orphans, disabled...).
Improving livelihoods

- **Poor households with some labour capacity** but less access to land, livestock and assets, less able to seize opportunities, women engaged in hand-to-mouth non-farm activities.

- PSNP in drought-prone sites; but often less support from mainstream extension services; difficulties covering costs of inputs > indebtedness > unwilling to engage with extension packages.

- More vulnerable to a range of shocks (drought, crop and livestock losses, illnesses) often leading to impoverishment.

- Rising **intergenerational** differentiation: older generation controlling access to land; longer youth transitions to adulthood (discussed later), limited livelihood options
Improving livelihoods (2)

• Some positive changes in **gender relations** (land rights, education, health, reduced HTPs) but girls and women still carry most domestic and reproductive activities alongside economic activities.

• Female-headed households: not a uniform category but often face constraints in both farm and non-farm sectors (also discussed later).

• **We suggested**
  – Promotion of **non-agricultural activities**
  – Extension and credit services **tailored to needs and abilities**
  – Expanding **support to MSEs in rural areas**.
  – **Insurance schemes** (e.g. livestock losses, health care) and subsidies for the poorest.
Vulnerable groups: Improving Social Protection

• Vulnerable groups (destitute, orphans, elderly without family, disabled) mostly supported by communities.

• Instances of stigmatisation (PLWHA, mentally-ill) or discrimination (craftworkers, in-migrants, labourers).

• We suggested an approach to Social Protection (2014) that
  – Recognises and responds to diverse needs
  – Builds linkages between formal social protection programmes (e.g. community-level social workers, pilot ‘community care coalitions’) and customary social protection institutions
  – Calls on wide range of local actors (wereda/kebele, CSOs, NGOs, private sector, community leaders, customary institutions)
  – Recognises importance of empathy towards poor and vulnerable people esp. by community level government agents.
Youth transitions to adulthood
Gendered youth passages to adulthood in rural Ethiopia: 13-15 boundary-crossings
Understanding gendered youth transitions

- Local concepts of and practices around these 15 youth transitions have strong customary economic, social & cultural rationales.
- Certain transitions (e.g. female circumcision, child marriage) are subject to considerable cultural variation.
- Youth are thought of as young men in relation to work transitions; whilst the focus on young women is directed to personal and family transitions.
- We suggested:
  - More balanced attention - to young women’s productive roles, and young men’s reproductive roles.
  - More attention to cultural rationales and diversity.
  - More holistic interventions, recognising the links between all types of transitions – e.g. marriage and economic independence for young couples seeking to establish themselves.
Girls’ transitions and transforming cultural values

- Interventions focused on stopping female circumcision & pre-18 marriage.

- **Overlooking rationales and diversity** (e.g. early marriage as protection from risks for girls, way out of poverty; different for pre-, mid-, late teens)

- **Tendency to rely on bans** – Needed but not sufficient, evidence of some resistance and practices going underground increasing risks.

- We suggested:
  - **Integrated approaches** incl. understanding rationales, involving coalition of local actors, trying to convince, reaching out to men/boys.
  - For older adolescent girls: **alternative risk protection** (greater focus on access to contraception, abortion, child care); promotion of **alternative pathways** through education, training & employment.
  - Respecting **young women’s agency** – e.g. special dispensation for 16-18 year-olds marriage; distinguishing forced abduction from ‘voluntary abduction’ or consensual marriage (young couple’s own choice).
Girls’ transitions: from reproductive health to productive roles

• Initiatives for sex education, girls’ toilets & sanitary materials in schools.

• Less attention to **broader reproductive health issues** facing adolescents.

• We suggested that

  – Youth sexual health should prioritise access to contraception, support with pre-marital pregnancies, abortions and child bearing; and involve young men and parents as well as young women.

• Nascent **shift in expectations** of families and girls, beyond ‘just education’; yet, limited policy attention to options for training, skills development and income-generation for older adolescent girls.

• We suggested that

  – **Options for young women’s productive roles** need more attention, including access to credit, greater involvement in youth and women cooperatives, promotion of MSEs, business and enterprise.
Work & community transitions: unleashing youth potential

- **Youth work transitions affected** by resources control by older generation (land), limited employment, capital and credit for income-generation.
- Many youth involved in *entrepreneurial activities*, especially in more integrated and diversified local economies; but *little support*.
- Youth cooperatives rarely successful (problems of credit, training, leadership, management and competition).
- Youth organisations focus on political mobilisation, seen as irrelevant.
- Youth involvement in community affairs constrained, due to difficulties in other transitions (delayed economic independence and marriage in particular).
- We suggested:
  - Expanding support to Micro and Small Scale Enterprises to small towns and *kebele* centres to reach rural areas
  - Building on both *individual & group entrepreneurship* of young men/women
  - Learning from successful cases of youth cooperatives.
  - And that youth enhanced economic activity will over time encourage their greater participation in community affairs, esp. for young women.
Reproductive health and well-being

Seven risks faced by young females due to their sexuality
The risks associated with customary practices

Four of the risks were associated with **long-standing customary practices**:

- Female circumcision
- **Forced abduction** intended to lead to marriage
- Other rape
- **Early marriage** associated with sexual activity, pregnancy, child-bearing and motherhood for which the girl is not ready physically and/or psychologically

National statistics show a **reduction in all these practices** associated with Government action

- 1987 National Committee on Harmful Traditional Practices
- Revision of the Family Code in 2000 – minimum marriage age 18
- Revised penal code 2004 – punishments related to illegal female circumcision, rape and forced abduction
The risks associated with modernising forces

Modernising forces with some consequences for girls’ reproductive health and well-being

- Expanding female education
- Increasing involvement of girls and young women in income-generating activities including migration for work
- Government action against early marriage

In many places these changes had reduced parental control of their teenage daughters and contributed to:

- Increases in youthful pregnancy outside marriage particularly among girls at secondary school
- In places where such pregnancies were ‘taboo’ unmarried girls were unlikely to have access to contraception
- And more likely to resort to potentially harmful customary abortions
The WIDE evidence 2010-13
Female circumcision in the WIDE communities 2010-13

- Female circumcision had customarily taken place at different ages in different cultural contexts: (1) at 7 days; (2) at or shortly before puberty often accompanied by ceremonies; and (3) just before marriage
  - Not a problem in 5 communities: never been practised in two communities, had been abandoned years ago in two Tigrayan communities (7 days) and ‘virtually stopped in one Oromia community (month before marriage)
  - Ban being enforced in 9 communities: e.g. cases of imprisonment and fining of practitioners; fear of legal measures had reportedly reduced the incidence; still different levels of secret practice
  - Ban not enforced in 6 communities: verbal campaigns against the practice but no enforcement of the law; 4 communities ignored the ban; reported reductions in 2

- In places with strong cultural support for the practice local official enforcement was often half-hearted

- Those most vulnerable to harm from circumcision were in the communities (1) where it happened before or in very early puberty and (2) where the operation was particularly severe (2 communities)
Rape in the WIDE communities 2010-13

- **Rape had reduced everywhere** but was **still seen as a problem in 11 of the communities**; 8 were in remote areas.

- In 9 communities it was reportedly not much of a problem any more.

- **Main rape risks** to unmarried girls reportedly came from:
  - Forced abduction
  - Walking or working some distance from home
  - From teenage boys of fifteen or so
  - In town houses rented by young males attending school
  - In one community from men infected with HIV/AIDS
  - Employers of domestic servants

- Given the stigma attached to unmarried girls who have been raped it is likely that it was more common than suggested in the data; there was **no evidence of rapists suffering stigma**.

- The 2004 revised criminal code was **not being properly implemented** in many of the WIDE communities, particularly those in remoter places.
Forced abduction in the WIDE communities 2010-13

- Forced abduction involves *kidnapping and rape* with the purpose of getting a wife.

- In the past in some cultures it was a *recognised form of marriage* to avoid refusal of consent by the parents or girl and/or excessive wedding ceremony expenses and brideprice.

- In some of the WIDE communities *voluntary abduction* or elopement was replacing forced abduction.

- Forced abduction was *still accepted as a possible route to marriage in eight WIDE communities*; six of them in remote areas.

- In seven of these communities rape more generally was a problem.

- *Pressure was put on abducted girls to marry* to avoid family stigma and the prospect no other man would be willing to marry them.

- There was *little evidence of interventions to help victims* of rape or forced abduction.
Early marriage in the WIDE communities 2010-13

- Landlessness, increasing education and income-generating activities, and independence from family among the under-18s had encouraged an increase in the average age of marriage in most communities.

- The age at which marriage was customarily acceptable varied:
  - 15 or above in 12 communities
  - Under 15 in 5 communities
  - Not clear in three communities where the wereda was working to impose the under-18 ban

- Reasons given for marriage under-18 included:
  - Personal choice
  - Lack of success at school or inability to pay secondary school costs
  - Economic necessity
  - Following abduction
  - To escape onerous domestic responsibilities at home or an ‘unpleasant stepmother’
  - Rich girls being ‘married off’ by parents
Pregnancy outside marriage in the WIDE communities

- **The lives of young women in transition to adulthood were being transformed:** chances of becoming a farmer’s wife decreasing; opportunities for education, local income-generating activities and migration for work increasing.

- School attendance contributed to **declining parental control** and chances for females and males to socialise in new ways.

- **Increasing independence** linked to a rise in pre-marital pregnancy which communities were still coming to terms with.

- **6 communities:** possible for unmarried young mothers to stay in the community with the child.

- **9 communities:** unmarried females could **easily access contraception**.

- Most communities: **pre-marital pregnancy still ‘taboo’** leading many to resort to potentially harmful customary abortions.
Conclusion

- The twenty WIDE communities had responded to interventions to eliminate practices causing harm to young females with a mix of compliance, reluctance and refusal depending on local cultural circumstances.

- **Law fit for purpose**: though strong case for institutionalising special dispensations allowing physically mature 16 to 17 year olds to marry.

- **Policy focus**: improve the educational campaigns on all the risks (particularly to change male attitudes) and implementation of the existing laws in all areas.

- WIDE data suggest high priority should be given everywhere to rape and marriage under the age of 16.

- **Focused campaigns** could be targeted at communities where girls from 12-14 are marrying as if they are adults, and where young and pre-pubertal girls are the subject of female circumcision and where the practice is more extreme.

- **More support for women affairs departments** would help: strong active women in wereda offices and kebeles had contributed to successful prevention of a number of individual cases of harmful practices.
Conclusion

• In many communities **unmarried girls who were sexually active** faced a set of linked problems involving **poor access to contraception**, **consequent unwanted pregnancies**, and **customary abortions**

• There was **little** WIDE3 evidence of **support from government services for girls harmed by any of these practices**
  – Damage caused by circumcision likely to be concealed to avoid potential punishments
  – Girls who were raped more likely to be stigmatised than offered counselling and modern abortions if they became pregnant
  – No reports of special services for early and mid-teen wives

• Full institutionalisation and effective implementation of **nation-wide adolescent reproductive services** would reduce unwanted pregnancies, customary abortions and marriage under 18.

• No sign of the National Adolescent and Youth Reproductive Health Strategy 2007-15 in the WIDE communities; no sign on the internet of a strategy 2016...
Education in rural communities 2010-13

Aspiration and uncertainty
Spectacular progress; outstanding and new challenges

• In most communities, bottleneck in access shifted from primary in 1995 to post-primary in 2010-13
• With ensuing much larger numbers of young people with some education
• Yet, scope to make education more inclusive
  • For the poor
  • For girls and young women
• And indispensable to make it more ‘fit for purpose’ in Ethiopia’s current socio-economic context.
In most sites, ‘bottleneck’ to access had shifted to post-primary – But:

• **Unequal access/achievements among sites** (hundreds of secondary or higher level leavers in better integrated or historically better served communities vs. fewer than ten secondary students in a remote agro-pastoralist community).

• **Quality** perceived as low; worse in remote/smaller/new schools

• **Deep access/achievement inequalities within** communities

• Poor/vulnerable youth at considerable disadvantage (costs, including ‘school contributions’), right from pre- and primary school level

• **Widespread irregular attendance**, esp. for poorer

• Many children/youth **combined/alternated work/school**.

We suggested achieving inclusive education would mean:

• Responding to the **needs of diverse and increasingly differentiated** rural Ethiopia – including poor/vulnerable

• Through a range of options **adaptable to local contexts and individual circumstances**
Addressing inequality

Through addressing financial constraints

- At community/school level - More support to disadvantaged areas/schools (e.g. larger grants, school feeding/incentive, teacher hardship compensation)

- At individual level - Scholarship schemes covering indirect costs at all levels; exempt poor/vulnerable from contributions (compensate schools)

Through more flexible schooling, allowing ‘drop-out-and-in’ and work/school, with a wider range of modalities and bridges between them:

- Schools to adapt calendar to community patterns (harvest, markets)
- Keep alternative basic education as option; expand evening classes, ease evening/day transition
- Modularise courses, ease admission regulation
- Sponsor/expand distance education (ICT-based outreach...).
Girls at school...
Changed/changing norms

Boys fetching water to clean classes in Oda Haro

Girls at volleyball in Oda Haro
Girls at school… Support change underway

Progress with girls’ education, challenging ‘conservative’ social norms but:

• Unequal between communities (e.g. Geblen vs Korodegaga)
• Same constraints/uncertainty as boys/young men
• +++ gender-specific challenges (domestic chores, lack of sanitation at school, early marriage, parents’ fear of early pregnancy)
• ➔ Participation in higher grades decreasing
• Marriage and pregnancy still most often mean stopping education.

We suggested supporting the change underway, through girl-friendly schools and combatting early marriage but also

• Better protection against unwanted pregnancies – systematic, age/ culture-sensitive sexual health advice (girls & boys) at school
• Specific guidance to schools & communities to readmit young married women & unmarried mothers
• Affirmative action – Priority to women for local, government-paid positions, as role models for girls/young women at school.
Education for what?

From **mixed perceptions** of education relevance in 1995, to **high expectations** of education as path to a better life, but

- **Return to uncertainty**, esp. in communities where many have invested a lot in education but low quality ➔ exam failure ➔ many ‘educated’ rural youth with no further education and poor job prospects
- **Aspirations geared towards academic success**, TVET at best a fall-back
- Whilst premium on skills will increase in transforming rural areas.

Valorising non-academic professions is key to addressing this **mismatch**, and achieve GoE rural job creation & industrial policy objectives

**We suggested:**

- **Strengthening quality of formal TVET**
- **Considerably expanding non-formal/informal TVET** (many pre-Gr8/10 leavers; Government lead)
- **Addressing public perceptions!**
Part II

Changes in livelihood opportunities
Mothers & infants’ wellbeing
Changes in Livelihood Opportunities
Selected insights
Changes in livelihood opportunities 1995-2013

• 2013 (before El Nino) - We found economic growth in all communities, and more diversified local economies.

• More so in communities with more agricultural potential, cash crops, irrigation, and better integrated (roads, access to market, closer to town), but even in more vulnerable sites.

• Evidence in looking at
  – Women’s and girls’ economic participation
  – Economically successful individuals (who were they, how did they become successful)
  – Migration – One of the ‘new’ economic opportunity.

• Role of government interventions in this greater economic dynamism: limited, and mixed.
Women’s expanding and diversifying opportunities...

• Important **opportunities in farm/non-farm sectors** (daily labour, industrial jobs, trade, small businesses etc.)

• Women’s/girls’ activities influenced by specific combinations of community and individual-level factors

• Progress limited by weaknesses:
  - In economically-focused interventions;
  - In broader ‘equitable employment’ and gender equity messaging and measures.
Influencing factors

**Community level - Infrastructural developments, investments**

- Driving upward economic participation of women in:
  - industrial jobs (coffee plants, shiro processing, flower farms, ...; esp. young)
  - increased trading (‘petty’, roadside and also larger-scale)
  - small businesses (‘urban’ services)
  - daily labour linked to irrigation

- **Esp. in ‘better connected’ communities** (good growth, improved roads, electricity, market connections, nearer urban centres)

**Individual level – Wealth, access to capital**

- Women with no land/capital - Multiple (by necessity) ‘hand-to-mouth’ activities; or reliant on support

- Wealthier women (capital/financial security) able to invest in more rewarding activities (e.g. larger-scale trade, small business), success.
Livelihoods support... Address gaps

• Women (esp. wives) often bypassed by agricultural extension; advice exclusive focus on ‘female activities’ (poultry, gardening etc.)
  ➔ Ensure agricultural extension reach out to women, incl. wives, and incl. but also beyond ‘female activities’.

• ‘Too little’ for women/girls specifically; low effectiveness
  ✔ Women’s co-ops: potential, but insufficient support/resources etc.
  ✔ Credit: some success; but demand >> supply; too risky for many
    ➔ Well-targeted ‘capital injection’ (grants/asset transfer)

• Young women ‘missed’ by youth interventions
  ➔ Better consider their specific needs, interests, constraints

• Lack of support for non-/off-farm activities
  ➔ Expand MSE support in rural areas (for both women and men)
Ensuring equitable and all-inclusive economic participation

- Expanded opportunities but issues related to equitable employment:
  - Unequal pay; low accessibility/feasibility for women with (or expecting) children; opportunities benefiting women but not in ‘higher-grade’ positions

- We suggested, in line with existing policies, consider provisions for inclusive/equitable employment:
  - Equal pay for equal tasks for women and men;
  - Provision of child care options, as well as maternity rights, in regulations on minimum work conditions;
  - Promoting awareness of employment rights (assertiveness/bargaining power)
  - Encourage affirmative action by investors to promote women’s employment
Further influencing norms/aspirations to build on changing perceptions

- Impact of broader gender equity drive - education, land, marriage rights; **changing perceptions** (women ‘not weak’, role ‘outside’)
- **Economically successful women ➔ further shift** (‘role model’ women’s influence; girls’ aspirations beyond customary roles)
- But **conservative norms persist; men concerns** (women ‘too powerful’, division of labour); competition for profitable activities.
- Reinforce **positive two-way dynamic between economic participation and shifting perceptions**:
  - More locally tailored women/girl economic participation interventions
  - Gender equity messages to men and women; addressing ‘real life’ situations/concerns (incl. those raised by men)
  - Broaden influence of existing ‘role model’ women in communities (e.g. invited in schools/media clubs to promote female trajectories)
Economic success in rural communities in 2010-13

A great diversity of profile in farm and non-farm sectors, men & women, young & older...
Economic success – Who, how, and effects

- **Who – Great diversity** – Older, younger, men, women, wives, women heads of households, farmers, traders, business people...

- ➔ Evidence of **more diverse, complex local economies**.

- **How - Synergy** between:
  - **Government action**
  - Broader **contextual changes** – including increased dynamism of communities (success as something to emulate)
  - **Personal initiative and drive** – making people to aspire
  - Access to some form of **capital** (land/labour, financial capital, social capital in various forms).

- Importance of **local contexts**, esp. infrastructure development & urbanisation/rural-urban links.

- Individual success ➔ ‘**spill-over’ effects**: further local opportunities (e.g. farmers’ success ➔ local trade, transport business).
Suggesting that...

- **Economic success cannot be simply replicated** through the same ‘standard actions’ for all; need actions tailored to local contexts, and individual circumstances.

- **Supporting individual initiatives** (alongside associations/co-ops) can contribute to stronger rural development outcomes.

- **Infrastructure investments targeted to local economic niches** would support local entrepreneurs (e.g. no bridge in irrigation potential site, poor road in niche coffee-producing site).

- More **support to local traders & agro-processing investment** (links in localised value chains) would enhance mutually reinforcing effects between local farm and non-farm sectors.
Selected government actions

**Extension services** key for successful farmers - Could be strengthened by:

- **Credit**/options to access inputs to support better **input use**
- Further tailoring to **local contexts** (‘alternative’ cash crops, irrigation)
- **Irrigation infrastructure development** to boost private investment
- Greater **focus on livestock extension** (vet care, breeds); livestock insurance schemes.

Financial capital critical yet **credit often hard to access** (collateral, red-tape, loans too small)

**Access to land** is key for big farmers’ growth but can be controversial

We suggested

- Encouraging **MFIs to adopt business-friendly approaches** and adapt collateral types (e.g. title deeds for high quality rural assets/houses)
- Strengthening **institutional mechanisms for land rental** – would also protect more vulnerable people & help address tensions around land
Risks, resilience, sustainability

- Economic success was possible for a range of individuals in a variety of different local contexts,
- But **vulnerable** to fluctuations (e.g. in product price) and shocks (e.g. drought or poor rains affecting production and costs/return balance).
- Successful individuals **managed risks by diversifying** within and across farm/non-farm sectors.
- Diversified portfolios also **enabled them to cross-invest** from one to another activity.
- This suggests:
  - **Caution in promoting specialisation** in economic activities at both community and individual levels (risks of mono-cropping if failure; of trading only one product if prices collapse).
  - That **access to a range of insurance types** (health, livestock etc.) would help secure economic success.
Rural mobility – rising with rural development

- **Expanded & more complex migration**: more people (women & youth), diverse destinations in (towns, factories, farms)/out of Ethiopia, varying durations (commuting, seasonal, years...)
- As a product of communities’ development and **higher aspirations**.
- **Young people** faced with limited local opportunities, wanting to ‘change their life’.
- Decisions by **individuals** or as **household strategy**.
- Variable outcomes.

**Urban/industrial migration**
- In all communities; ‘important’ in twelve.
- Costs small compared to migration abroad; reduced pressure on local resources (land), one fewer mouth to feed.
- But **often precarious life, small returns, exploitation** (esp. women, in domestic or hospitality work, sometimes mixed with prostitution).
Migration abroad

Migration abroad, important in both striving/struggling communities; gendered pattern – feasible legally for young women, not young men.
Costly so poorer people make riskier choices to be able to travel.

- Irregular migration was risky; legal migration not without risks too; risks known but insufficient deterrent for many.

When successful, considerable positive effects (individual, hh & community): wellbeing (housing, diet, clothing, health care), social protection (support to elderly parents, siblings), human development investment (siblings’ education), local economic investment, diversification and strengthening of rural-urban links.
A sensitive policy issue...

WIDE evidence: **well-managed rural migration can contribute** to rural development as well as GOE economic transformation goal.

We suggested considering:

- **Strengthening migration management capacity** through clear policy and research to understand its evolution.

- **Measures to maximise returns** of successful migration, e.g.
  - Cheaper transfer & better saving conditions
  - Use of remittances to subscribe to insurances (formalising social protection effects) or as collateral for credit (multiplying economic investment potential)
  - Advisory services to migrants/households to select worthwhile economic investment
  - Including possibly co-financing local infrastructure development to boost local development (Gurage tradition).
WIDE evidence suggests that both urban/industrial migration & migration abroad are likely to continue to increase with rural development.

And women’s mobility is a potential asset at least as important as men’s (changing/ed social norms etc.)

Hence the importance of improving migration experiences. We suggested:

• Better information on and preparation for available jobs, enhanced migration management, strengthening/enforcing legal frameworks for both urban/industrial and abroad migration.

• Giving urban migrants access to support to SME development.

• Developing formal financing options for poorer would-be migrants.

• Special attention to ensure women benefit fully from migration (e.g. focus on minimum work conditions in domestic and hospitality jobs; easing young women’s access to independent banking options).

• Seeking ways to expand legal job opportunities abroad for young men.
Reproductive health and well-being

Mothers and infants
Improvements in mother and infant well-being 2003-13


These improvements resulted from a range of interacting modernisation processes related to government interventions across key sectors leading to:

• increasing rural wealth and incomes
• improvements in rural infrastructure and services
• modernisation of rural attitudes
• improvements in rural women’s education and status
• social protection in drought-prone communities
• the Health Extension Programme
• increased rural access to modern reproductive and curative health services.

However, there were still many problems; in particular mother-baby couples in remote places, in poverty, and during droughts were at risk of harm.
Issues

• 15 months of the pregnancy-infancy cycle when the mother-baby couple face a number of joint risks:
  – 9 months of pregnancy;
  – delivery;
  – 6 months of (ideally breastfed) infancy

• Issues important throughout the 15 months: remoteness, poverty, drought, seasonality effects, quality of drinking water, women’s work

• Pregnancy issues: being pregnant, complications, Ante-Natal-Care

• Delivery issues: maternal & infant deaths & birth injuries

• Post-natal issues: Post-Natal-Care, infant illnesses, maternal physical and mental health

• This presentation focuses on drought, poverty, remoteness, and Ante-Natal and Post-Natal Care and deliveries
The WIDE evidence on drought, poverty and remoteness
• Droughts led to food and water shortages, and in some places heavy income-generating activities for women such as firewood selling

• 2003-11: Ten WIDE communities suffered severe droughts in 2 or more years

• June 2016: Thirteen of the communities affected by the El Niño drought

• Poverty: big differences in community wealth - in four WIDE communities in 2004 absolute rural asset wealth scores were 1.61, 2.57, 3.11 and 4.59 (max 5)

• Big differences in household wealth: in same communities in 2004 relative productive asset wealth scores assessed 34-44% of the households as relatively poor including 5-9% destitute

• Many cases of poor pregnant women and mothers with inadequate diets doing heavy and time-consuming work and not using health services

• Remoteness: example - distance from a hospital:
  – on or near an allweather road – 17 communities
  – 4 communities < 10 kms; 7 communities 11-23 kms; 6 communities 42-94 kms
  – problems getting to an allweather road
  – 3 communities – once on road 24-42 kms to the hospital
Ante-Natal and Post-Natal Care
Health Extension Workers were effectively giving women advice on good diets, avoiding hard work, taking rest and hygiene but many women were unable to follow it.

The 2014 mini EDHS estimated that 54% of rural women received some Ante-Natal-Care (ANC) from a skilled provider or HEW although the content varied considerably.

In the WIDE communities supply barriers to getting the necessary ANC tests included lack of instruments, distance to Health Centres, and rude service in Health Centres.

There was no demand from many women particularly those who were poor and/or remote.
Post-Natal Care 2010-13

• In the WIDE communities Health Extension Workers were effectively giving women advice on good diets, breast-feeding, and hygiene but many women were unable to follow it

• Extract from Health Sector Transformation Plan 2015/16 – 2019/20  p26

The postnatal period is a critical phase in the lives of mothers and newborn babies. Most maternal and infant deaths occur during this time. Therefore, postnatal care (was) one of the high impact interventions planned in the HSDP with a target of 78% by the year 2014/15 (EFY 2007).

Although PNC in the first two days is not captured by HMIS, the EDHS 2014 reported coverage of 12% for PNC within the recommended two days period. Nevertheless, this is an improvement from three years ago with only 7%. However, the HMIS report showed higher coverage of 66% for PNC in EFY 2006 (2013/14)

• The large difference between the EDHS (random household sample) statistic and that from the HMIS (health workers’ reports) suggests a big problem with the latter

• In the WIDE communities PNC was not given the emphasis that ANC was by health workers
Delivery

- Parenteral Antibiotics
- Parenteral Dehydrating Drug
- Anticonvulsants
- Manual Removal of Placenta
- Removal of Retained Product of Conception
- Assisted Vaginal Delivery (vacuum extraction)
- Newborn Care
Maternal mortality and deliveries 1

- Fieldwork in the WIDE communities took place in early 2010 (6 communities), late 2011 (8 communities) and spring and late 2013 (6 communities)
- The WIDE 3 data on delivery reflects changes in Government policy regarding deliveries related to their campaign to meet the maternal mortality MDG by 2015
- In early 2010 the aim was ‘clean and safe’ deliveries in Health Posts
- There was evidence of Health Extension Worker training and provision of delivery equipment in Health Posts, though the two did not always match; seemed to be few deliveries in the HPs; clean water problems in many
- Health Sector Development Programme IV (July 2010-June 2015) obligated regional governments to decrease the MMR through the improvement of Skilled Birth Attendance
Maternal mortality and deliveries 2

- **Measures** to be taken included assigning ambulances to weredas, free maternity services, and use of ‘health development armies’ and HEWs to mobilise women to deliver in Health Centres.

- **There were some signs of this campaign in 2011; there were more in 2013**
  - ‘clean and safe deliveries’ in Health Posts abandoned
  - ambulances mentioned though no reports of use
  - reports of pressure on pregnant women to deliver at Health Centres during ANC and from HEWs
  - Introduction of a ‘delivery-friendly’ environment in Health Centres including traditional post-birth porridge ceremonies with grain contributed by the community
  - Traditional Birth Attendants warned to stop deliveries
  - HEWs reported education through Development Team and 1-5 leaders (the Health Development Army) though other evidence suggested these structures were not working
In 2014 91% of rural women delivered their babies without skilled assistance (Mini Ethiopian Demographic Household Survey).

In the WIDE communities the big supply constraints on skilled delivery were:

- distance to Health Centres along poor internal roads;
- inadequate staff and drugs;
- rare ambulance service;
- costs of hospital service and transport.

Barriers to demand included:

- perceived lack of need, especially if ANC monitoring showed no problems;
- taboos about male staff;
- the cultural unacceptability of being out in public six hours after birth.

Inadequate supply of skilled delivery and expensive obstetric services at health facilities, combined with remoteness, poverty and personal choice will continue to prevent many pregnant women from delivering at Health Centres and hospitals in the foreseeable future.
The development and management of a system with \textbf{five options of place of delivery would improve the safety net} for rural women and their infants and contribute to reductions in maternal and infant deaths:

– Home; Health Post; Health Centre; Government hospital: Private clinic or hospital

An \textbf{out-reach service} supporting safe & clean delivery at home or the Health Post could:

– improve the functioning of the referral system for pregnant women at risk;

– re-instate deliveries in upgraded Health Posts by HEWs with diplomas (planned in GTPII);

– select suitable women from Health Development Armies for training in safe and clean delivery and emergency procedures; provide safe delivery kits

– use Health Development Armies to educate all women likely to assist with deliveries in clean and safe practices and simple emergency procedures; this could be facilitated by the use of Information and Communication Technology.

– use non-grid electricity – solar and wind power and micro-hydels – to power mobile phone apps and support education and skyping to skilled delivery advisory services in times of emergency.
Conclusion: improving the wellbeing of mothers and infants

• The state should take full responsibility for the health and well-being of all women and their infants throughout the pregnancy-infancy cycle

• Institutionalised maternity rights for women should include:
  – ANC and Post-Natal-Care as near home as possible.
  – choice of place of delivery if no complications
  – free skilled delivery/obstetric care for all identified at risk during ANC or suffering an emergency during labour.
  – an advisory period of ‘maternity leave’ linked to general community education about pregnant and lactating women’s needs related to diet, drinking water, workloads, lifting heavy objects, rest, etc.

• There is a case for considering different mixes of types of mother-and-baby services for different kinds of rural communities, according to
  – terrain, settlement pattern, and urban proximity
Selected conclusions

Three policy themes
  Growth, poverty and inequalities
  Change over time and space
  Gender, age and experiences of change

A remark on policy approaches
Three broad policy themes

**Growth, poverty and inequalities**

- WIDE evidence of importance of *agriculture* – including irrigation – in local economic growth, but also of *diversification* into non-farm
  - More investment in irrigation: support to different sizes, management modalities, techniques; infrastructure, technical and managerial support
  - More support to non-farm sector activities (e.g. MSEs in rural areas, local agro-business investments).
- Not everyone did well. Evidence of *people/groups missing out* economically, in access to education and health services, trapped in poverty
  - More interventions are needed, but which “*do things differently*” to reach out to poor and vulnerable, starting by understanding where they start from.
Three broad policy themes (2)

Change over time and space

• Strong space-change link; greater change in better connected/ integrated sites.

• **Reducing rural remoteness** – incl. **within** communities, often overlooked in policy.

• Attention to internal roads and paths as well as *kebele*-connecting roads.

• Development/expansion of off-grid electrification options to support ICT-based options of access to services (e.g. agric & health advise, distance education etc.).
Genderage and experiences of change

- WIDE evidence of progress, though mixed, with gender equality; and longer, more complex transitions of youth to adulthood.
- Interventions need to think holistically about gender-aged individuals, with gender-aged specific needs, potentials and constraints, and who have to decide and act simultaneously in all domains of their life.
- E.g. attention to young men’s reproductive/young women’s productive roles, to women’s baby-making role together with economic role etc.
A remark on policy-making & implementation approach

WIDE shows the value of the current standardized, hierarchical & disciplined approach, but also its limits.

Six interlinked features to strengthen interventions’ effectiveness:

1) the value of a **holistic approach** to policy;
2) the importance of **taking account of diversity** hence contextualising (“one size does not fit all”);
3) the benefits, therefore, of a ‘**bottom-up’ approach** attentive to local knowledge, local innovation & learning processes;
4) the importance of **allowing space for experimenting** with local ideas and with a wide range of options in interventions;
5) the **effectiveness of working with broad coalitions** of various kinds of actors with a view to harnessing all potentials, ideas and power;
6) the **value of more modest but realistic ambitions** in implementation.